

Table of contents

Preface

Sir Robin Jacob

Foreword

Part I

The theory of the art and craft of judgment-writing

1. On judgments
2. Judgments: purpose and audience
3. Judgment-length
4. Judgment-style
5. Judgment-structure
6. Dissenting and concurring judgments
7. Children, families, and immigrants
8. Authors and judges

Part II

The practice of the art and craft of judgment-writing

9. Three great and pioneering women judges
10. Three great american judges
11. Three great british judges
12. Great judges from the wider common law world

Part III

***Ex tempore* judgments**

13. The art and craft of *ex tempore* judgments

Table of cases

Appendix: the judgment as the art of truth

Select bibliography

Table of cases

Australia

Australian Communist Party v Commonwealth (1951) 83 C.L.R. 1 (HCA).
Bank of New South Wales v The Commonwealth [1948] HCA 7 (HCA).
Birmingham v Renfrew (1937) 57 C.L.R. 666 (HCA).
Hadid v Redpath [2001] NSWCA 416 (NSW CA).
Yerkey v Jones (1939) 63 C.L.R. 649 (HCA).

Canada

Andrews v Law Society of British Columbia [1989] 1 S.C.R. 143 (SC).
Cojocar v British Columbia Women's Hospital & Health Center [2013] 2 S.C.R. 357 (SC).
R. v Cameron [1966] 2 O.R.777 (Ontario CA).
R. v Burnshine [1975] 1 S.C.R. 693 (SC).
Nova Scotia Board of Censors v McNeil [1978] 2 S.C.R. 662 (SC).
Attorney General for Canada & Dupond v Montreal [1978] 2 S.C.R. 770 (SC).
R. v Morgentaler [1988] 1 S.C.R. 30 (SC).
R. v Lavallée [1990] 1 S.C.R. 852 (SC).
R. v Sheppard [2002] 1 S.C.R. 869 (SC).

England and Wales; Scotland

A & others v Home Secretary [2004] UKHL 56; [2005] 2 A.C. 68 (HL).
A v Home Secretary (No 2) [2005] UKHL 71; [2006] 2 A.C. 221 (HL).
Abrath v North-Eastern Railway Company [1886-90] All E.R. Rep. 179 (HL).
Allen v Jambo Holdings Ltd [1980] 1 W.L.R. 1252 (CA).
Banco de Portugal v Waterlow [1932] A.C. 452 (HL).
Barclays Bank v O'Brien [1994] 1 A.C. 180 (HL).
Beamish v Beamish (1861) 11 E.R. 735 (HL).
Bell v Lever Bros [1932] A.C. 161 (HL).
Beswick v Beswick [1966] Ch. 538 (CA).
Bole v Horton (1673) 124 E.R. 1113 (CtCP).
Bowen v Hall (1881) 6 Q.B.D. 333 (CA).
Bromley v Bromley [1964] 3 All E.R. 226 (CA).
Burt v Claude Cousins & Co. Ltd [1971] 2 QB 426 (CA).
Cambridge Water Co Ltd v Eastern Counties Leather plc [1994] 2 A.C. 264 (HL).
Candler v Crane Christmas and Co. [1951] 2 K.B. 164 (CA).
Caswell v Powell Duffryn Associated Collieries [1940] A.C. 152 (HL).
Central London Property Trust Ltd v High Trees House Ltd [1956] 1 All E.R. 256 (KBD).
Cinnamond v British Airports Authority [1980] 1 W.L.R. 582 (CA).

Cornford v Carlton Bank Ltd [1899] 1 Q.B. 392 (QBD).
Cauldwell Concrete Flooring Ltd v HMRC [2016] UKFIT 776 (TC).
Coventry Corporation v Surrey County Council [1935] A.C. 199 (HL).
Darlington Borough Council v Wiltshire Northern Ltd [1995] 1 W.L.R. 68 (CA).
De Falco v Crawley Borough Council [1980] QB 460 (CA).
Deeble v Robinson [1954] 1 Q.B. 77 (CA).
Dickson v Pharmaceutical Society of Great Britain [1967] Ch. 708 (CA).
Distinctive Properties (Ascot) Ltd and Secretary of State for Communities and Local Government [2015] EWHC 729 (HC).
Donoghue v Stevenson [1932] A.C. 562 (HL).
DPP v Smith [1961] A.C. 290 (HL).
Erlenger v New Sombrero Phosphate Co. [1874-80] All E.R. Rep. 271 (HL).
Everett v Griffiths [1920] 3 K.B. 163 (CA), [1921] 1 A.C. 631 (HL).
Eves v Eves [1975] 1 W.L.R. 1338 (CA).
Ex parte Hook [1976] 3 All E.R. 452 (CA).
Ex parte Hosenball [1977] 1 W.L.R. 766 (CA).
Ex parte Johnson Trust Ltd [1974] QB 24 (CA).
Fender v Mildmay [1938] A.C. 1 (HL).
Financial Conduct Authority v Arch Insurance (UK) Ltd and ors [2021] UKSC 1 (SC).
Flower v Ebbw Vale Steel, Iron and Coal Co Ltd [1934] 2 K.B. 132 (KBD/CA).
Gautret v Egerton (1867) L.R. 2 C.P. 371 (CtCP).
Gee v National Trust [1966] 1 All E.R. 954 (CA).
George Mitchell (Chesterhall) Ltd v Finney Lock Seeds [1982] 3 W.L.R. 1036 (CA).
Ghani v Jones [1969] 3 All E.R. 1700 (CA).
Gregson v Gilbert (1783) 99 E.R. 629 (Ct.KB).
H v H [2020] EWFC 9 (Fam.Ct).
Hedley Byrne & Co. Ltd v Heller & Partners Ltd [1964] A.C. 465 (HL).
Hinz. v Berry [1970] 2 Q.B. 40 (CA).
Indermaur v Dames (1866) L.R. 1 C.P. 274 (CtCP).
Inland Revenue Commissioners v Rossminster Ltd [1980] 2 W.L.R. 1 (HL).
Ionian Bank Ltd v Couvreur [1969] 1 W.L.R. 781 (CA).
James v Minister for Pensions [1947] K.B. 867 (CA).
Jennings Motors Ltd v Secretary of State for the Environment [1982] 2 W.L.R. 131 (CA).
Jones v Randall (1774) 98 E.R. 954 (CtKB).
Kelly v London Transport Executive [1982] 2 All E.R. 842 (CA).
Kemble v Farren (1829) 130 E.R. 1234 (CtCP).
Lamb v Camden Borough Council [1981] Q.B. 625 (CA).
Lancashire County Council v M and others [2016] EWFC 9 (HC).
Langdon v Suremanor Ltd [1984] Lexis Citation 1538 (CA).
Lau v Chu [2020] UKPC 24 (PC).
Levinson v Patent Steam Carpet Cleaning Co Ltd [1978] Q.B. 69 (CA).
Liversidge v Anderson [1942] A.C. 206 (HL).

Lloyds Bank Ltd v Bundy [1975] Q.B. 326 (CA).
Mandla v Dowell Lee [1983] QB 1 (CA).
Marks v Feldman (1870) L.R. 5 Q.B. 275 (Exch.).
Marsden v Regan [1954] 1 All E.R. 423 (CA).
McIlkenny v Chief Constable of West Midlands Police Force [1980] 2 All E.R. 227 (CA).
Midland Bank Trust Co Ltd v Green [1980] Ch. 590 (CA).
Midland Bank Trust Co Ltd v Green (No. 3) [1982] 2 W.L.R. 1 (CA).
Miller v Jackson [1977] Q.B. 966 (CA).
Ministry of Defence v Jeremiah [1980] 1 Q.B. 87 (CA).
Mr Patrick v Mrs Patrick [2017] Lexis Citation 282 (Sh.Ct).
Myers v Milton Keynes Development Corporation [1974] 1 W.L.R. 696 (CA).
Nakkuda Ali v Jayartyne [1951] A.C. 66 (PC).
Pearse v Pearse (1846) 63 E.R. 950 (Ct.Ch.).
Pharmaceutical Society v London and Provincial Supply Association [1874-80] All E.R. Rep. Ext. 1363 (HL).
Phillips v Eyre (1870) L.R. 6 Q.B. 1 (Exch.).
R. (Forge Care Homes Ltd and ors) v Cardiff and Vale University Health Board and ors [2016] EWCA Civ. 26 (CA).
R. v Druitt (1867) 10 Cox C.C. 592 (CCC).
R. v Middleton [1861-73] All E.R. Rep. Ext. 1120 (CtCC).
R. v Prince [1874-80] All E.R. Rep. 881 (CCR).
R. v Slough Borough Council [1981] Q.B. 801 (CA).
R. (Begum) v Governors of Denbigh High School [2006] UKHL 15; [2007] 1 A.C. 100 (HL).
R. (Jackson) v Attorney General [2005] UKHL 56; [2006] 1 A.C. 262 (HL).
R. (Miller) v Secretary of State for Exiting the European Union [2016] EWHC 2768 (Admin.) (Div. Ct).
Radcliffe v Ribble Motor Services [1939] A.C. 215 (HL).
Rank Film Distributors Ltd v Video Information Centre [1982] A.C. 380 (CA).
Re A: A Letter to a Young Person [2017] EWFC 48 (HC).
Re C (Interim Care Order) [2011] EWCA Civ. 918 (CA).
Read v J. Lyons and Co. Ltd [1947] A.C. 156 (HL).
Reid v Metropolitan Police Commissioner [1973] Q.B. 551 (CA).
Riche v Ashbury Railway Carriage Co (1874) L.R. 9 Exch. 224 (Exch).
Rylands v Fletcher [1861-73] All E.R. Rep. 1 (HL).
Secretary of State for Employment v Globe Elastic Thread Co. Ltd [1979] QB 183 (CA).
Shell International Petroleum Ltd v Gibbs [1982] 2 W.L.R. 745 (CA).
Shirt v Shirt [2012] EWCA Civ. 1029 (CA).
Somerset's Case; Somerset v Stewart (1772) 98 E.R. 499 (KB).
Southam v Smout [1964] 1 Q.B. 308 (CA).
Southcote v Stanley (1856) 156 E.R. 1195 (Exch.).
SS v NS (Spousal Maintenance) [2014] EWHC 4183 (Fam) (HC).
Tenant v Goldwin [1704] 92 E.R. 222 (KB).

Thomas v Roberts (1850) 64 E.R. 693 (VC.Ct.).
TuneIn Inc v Warner Music U.K. Ltd and anor [2021] EWCA Civ. 441 (CA).
White v Jones [1995] 2 A.C. 207 (CA).
Yates v Yates [1988] Lexis Citation 1427 (CA).

European Court of Human Rights

Hutchinson v United Kingdom [2017] ECHR 57592/08.
Sunday Times v United Kingdom [1979] ECHR 6538/74.

India

ADM Jabalpur v Shivkant Shukla 1976 A.I.R. 1207 (SCI).
Kesavananda Bharati v State of Kerala (1973) 4 SC 225 (SCI).
K.S. Puttaswamy v Union of India (2017) 10 S.C.C. 1 (SCI).
Shine v Union of India (2018) 46 B.H.R.C. 637 (SCI).
State of Gujarat v Justice RA Mehta (Retd) [2013] 1 S.C.R. 1 (SCI).

Ireland

Byrne v Ireland [1972] IR 241 (SC).
CC v Ireland [2006] 4 I.R. 1 (SC).
McGee v Attorney General [1974] IR 287 (SC).
MH and SH (a minor suing by her mother and next friend) v Minister for Justice and Equality (No.2) [2020] IEHC 436 (HC).
State (Quinn) v Ryan [1965] IR 70 (SC).
State (Ryan) v Lennon [1935] IR 170 (SC).
Walsh and Cassidy v County Council for the County Sligo [2014] 2 I.L.R.M. 161 (SC).

Israel

Kol Ha'am Co. Ltd v Minister of the Interior (1953) HCJ 73/53 (SC/HCJ).
Mandelbrot v Attorney General (1956) CrimA 118/53 (SC/CCA).
Seedis v Seedis (1954) Special Tribunal 1/50 (SC/Sp.Trib.).
Shmuel v Attorney General (1964) CA 525/63 (SC).

New Zealand

Lodder v Lodder [1921] NZLR 876 (SC).
Park v Minister for Education [1922] NZLR 1208 (SC).
Taylor v Combined Buyers Ltd [1924] NZLR 627 (SC).

United states

Abrams v United States 250 U.S. 616 (1919) (SC).
Adair v United States 208 U.S. 161 (1908) (SC).
Boumediene v Bush 553 U.S. 723 (2008) (SC).
Bowers v Hardwick 478 U.S. 186 (1986) (SC).
Buck v Bell 274 U.S. 200 (1927) (SC).
Burnet v Coronado Oil & Gas Co. 285 U.S. 393 (1932) (SC).
Bush v Gore 531 U.S. 98 (2003) (SC).
City of Sherrill v Oneida Indian Nation of New York 544 U.S. 197 (2005) (SC).
Commonwealth v Robin 421 Pa.70 (Pa. 1966) (Penn.SC).
Communications Assn v Douds 339 U.S. 382 (1950) (SC).
District of Columbia v Heller 128 S. Ct. 2783 (2008) (SC).
Engle v Isaac 456 U.S. 107 (1982) (SC).
Fisher v Lowe 333 N.W. 2d 67 (Mich. Ct. App. 1983) (Michigan CA).
Gitlow v New York 268 U.S. 652 (1925) (SC).
Grutter v Bollinger 539 U.S. 306 (2003) (SC).
Hein v Freedom from Religion Foundation 551 U.S. 587 (2007) (SC).
Johnson v Transportation Agency 480 U.S. 616 (1987) (SC).
Korematsu v United States 323 U.S. 214 (1944) (SC).
Kunz v New York 340 U.S. 290 (1951) (SC).
Lampf v Gibertson 501 U.S. 350 (1991) (SC).
Lawrence v Texas 539 U.S. 558 (2003) (SC).
Lee v Weisman 505 U.S. 577 (1992) (SC).
Lochner v New York 198 U.S. 45 (1905) (SC).
Marbury v Madison 5 U.S. 137 (1803) (SC).
Massachusetts v United States 333 U.S. 611 (1948) (SC).
MacPherson v Buick Motor Co 217 NY 382 (1916) (New York CA).
McGrath v Kristensen 340 U.S. 162 (1950) (SC).
Mississippi University for Women v Hogan 458 U.S. 718 (1982) (SC).
Northern Securities Co. v United States 193 U.S. 197 (1904) (SC).
Obergefell v Hodges 576 U.S. 644 (2015) (SC).
Planned Parenthood of Southeastern Pennsylvania v Casey 505 U.S. 833 (1992) (SC).
Plaut v Spendthrift Farm Incorporated 514 U.S. 211 (1995) (SC).
Reed v Allen 286 U.S. 191 (1931) (SC).
Republican Party of Minnesota v White 536 U.S. 765 (2002) (SC).
Roe v Wade 410 U.S. 113 (1973) (SC).
Rosenberger v Rector 515 U.S. 819 (1995) (SC).
Schenck v United States 249 U.S. 47 (1919) (SC).
Shaughnessy v Mezei 345 U.S. 206 (1953) (SC).
Southern Pacific Co. v Jensen 244 U.S. 205 (1917) (SC).

Standard Fire Insurance Co. v Reese (1979) 584 SW 2d 835 (Texas SC).
Terminiello v Chicago 337 U.S. 1 (1949) (SC).
United States v Johnson 221 U.S. 488 (1911) (SC).
United States v South-Eastern Underwriters Association 322 U.S. 533 (1944) (SC).
United States v Virginia 518 U.S. 515 (1996) (SC).
West Virginia State Board of Education v Barnette 319 U.S. 624 (1943) (SC).
Youngstown Sheet & Tube Co. v Sawyer 343 U.S. 579 (1952) (SC).