

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>Foreword</i>	v
<i>Preface</i>	vii
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xxiii
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	xlvi
<i>Table of Practice Directions</i>	lxxiii

CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION

1.1 What this Book is About.....	3
1.2 Uniqueness of the Hong Kong Legal System.....	6
1.3 Constitutional Significance of Appeals and Judicial Reviews in Hong Kong.....	9
1.4 Criminal Appeals are Creatures of Statute.....	12
1.5 Requirements and Limitations of the Right to Appeal in art.11(4) of the Hong Kong Bill of Rights.....	12
1.5.1 How many times can a person appeal?.....	15
1.5.2 The requirement of leave.....	15
1.5.3 Delay in appeal proceedings.....	17
1.5.4 Mandatory sentences.....	17
1.5.5 Privative/ouster clauses.....	18
1.5.6 Loss of time order.....	19
1.6 Five Key Questions.....	20
1.7 Justifications for having an Appellate Jurisdiction.....	20
1.8 Appealing and Reviewing Moot Points.....	22
1.9 Death of Appellant.....	23
1.10 Appeal Court Overturning Previous Appellate Decisions.....	24
1.11 Finding Errors: Giving of Reasons.....	24
1.12 Avoiding Appealable Errors.....	25
1.13 Types of Error.....	26
1.14 Competing Considerations.....	27
1.14.1 Principle of finality.....	27
1.14.2 Prosecution appeal rights.....	30
1.14.3 Avoidance of fragmentation.....	30
1.14.4 Limited court resources.....	30
1.14.5 Jury confidentiality rule.....	30
1.15 Correcting Mistakes: Reopening Appeal Judgments.....	31
1.15.1 The perfection rule.....	31
1.15.2 The slip rule.....	32
1.15.3 The residual discretion after perfection.....	32
1.16 Prospective and Retrospective Effect of Appeal Court Rulings.....	33
1.17 Types of Appeals and Reviews.....	34
1.17.1 Retrial: <i>de novo</i> hearing.....	36
1.17.2 General appeal: rehearing (not from a discretion).....	36

1.17.3	General appeal: Appealing exercise of a judicial discretion	39
1.17.4	Review of sentence (on an application by the prosecution)	42
1.17.5	Strict appeal	42
1.17.6	Referral and applications	43
1.18	The Requirement of Leave	43
1.18.1	Leave required	44
1.18.2	Leave not required	44
1.19	Double Jeopardy	47
1.20	Role of Counsel	48
1.21	Distinctive Role of the Court of Final Appeal	49
1.22	Structure of the Book	50
Appendix 1		51

CHAPTER 2 HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT OF CRIMINAL APPEALS IN HONG KONG

2.1	Introduction	58
2.2	Brief History of the Prerogative Writs	62
2.2.1	<i>Certiorari</i>	62
2.2.2	<i>Mandamus</i>	64
2.2.3	Prohibition	64
2.2.4	<i>Habeas corpus</i>	65
2.3	Common Law Appeal Rights in England Pre-Twentieth Century	67
2.4	Criminal Appeal Act 1907 (UK)	68
2.4.1	Creation of the Court of Criminal Appeal	68
2.4.2	Registrar of the Court of Criminal Appeal	69
2.4.3	Grounds of appeal	69
2.4.4	Grounds for determining the appeal	70
2.4.5	Disposition powers	70
2.4.6	Appeal on multiple counts	72
2.4.7	Alternative verdicts	72
2.4.8	Insanity	72
2.4.9	Stays	72
2.4.10	Procedure	73
2.5	Straits Settlements: Court of Criminal Appeal Ordinance 1931	76
2.5.1	Creation of the Court of Criminal Appeal	77
2.5.2	Registrar of the Court of Criminal Appeal	77
2.5.3	Grounds of appeal	78
2.5.4	Grounds for determining the appeal	78
2.5.5	Disposition powers	78
2.5.6	Appeal on multiple counts	78
2.5.7	Alternative verdicts	79
2.5.8	Insanity	79
2.5.9	Stays	79
2.5.10	Procedure	79
2.5.11	Why the Court of Criminal Appeal in the Straits Settlements was not established earlier	82
2.5.12	Factors behind the establishment of the Court of Criminal Appeal	83

2.6	Hong Kong	84
2.6.1	The early years: 1841–1933	84
2.6.2	1933: Amendment of the Criminal Procedure Ordinance 1899	90
2.6.3	1933–1997	103
2.6.4	Conclusion	108

CHAPTER 3 THE COURT SYSTEM AND THE ROLE OF THE PROSECUTION IN APPEALS

3.1	Introduction	112
3.2	The Court System	112
3.2.1	Diagram 1: Overview of the court structure and appeal paths in Hong Kong	113
3.2.2	The Juvenile Court	113
3.2.3	The Magistrates' Court	115
3.2.4	The District Court	116
3.2.5	The High Court	118
3.2.6	The Court of First Instance	118
3.2.7	The Court of Appeal	118
3.2.8	The Court of Final Appeal	120
3.3	General Features of Appeal Paths	121
3.3.1	Appeals from the Magistrates' Court	121
3.3.2	Appeals from the District Court	122
3.3.3	Appeals from the Court of First Instance	122
3.4	Role of the Prosecution in Appeals and Reviews	123
3.4.1	Introduction	123
3.4.2	Who is responsible for public prosecutions?	124
3.4.3	Overall role of the prosecution in criminal proceedings	129
3.4.4	How the role of the prosecution is different from the role of the defence	130
3.4.5	The double jeopardy principle and the prosecution	131
3.4.6	Challenging prosecution decisions by appeal or review	132
3.4.7	Prosecution appeal and review rights	135

CHAPTER 4 APPEALS AND REVIEWS FROM THE JUVENILE COURT

4.1	Introduction	141
4.2	Key Sources of Law	141
4.3	Constitution of the Juvenile Court	141
4.4	Criminal Jurisdiction by Age	141
4.4.1	<i>Doli incapax</i>	142
4.5	Criminal Jurisdiction by Offence	143
4.5.1	Indictable offences	143
4.5.2	Remittal of cases to the Juvenile Court	143
4.6	Procedural Laws Applicable to Hearings in the Juvenile Court	144
4.7	Rehabilitative and Welfare Considerations Underpinning the Court	144
4.8	Parental Involvement in Proceedings	145
4.9	Sentencing Options	146

4.10	Rights of Appeal	147
4.10.1	Overview of appeals and reviews	147
4.10.2	Review by magistrate: s.104 of the Magistrates Ordinance	148
4.10.3	Appeal against conviction: s.113 of the Magistrates Ordinance	149
4.10.4	Appeal against sentence by offender: s.113 of the Magistrates Ordinance	150
4.10.5	Disposition powers on appeal against conviction, sentence or case stated	150
4.10.6	General procedure on an appeal under ss.105 and 113 of the Magistrates Ordinance	151
4.10.7	Application by Secretary for Justice for review of sentence: s.81A of the Criminal Procedure Ordinance	154
4.10.8	Appeal by way of case stated: s.105 of the Magistrates Ordinance	155
4.10.9	Other types of appeals and reviews	157
4.10.10	Costs in proceedings in Juvenile Court	159

CHAPTER 5 APPEALS AND REVIEWS FROM THE MAGISTRATES' COURT

5.1	Introduction	165
5.2	Key Sources of Law	165
5.3	Constitution of the Magistrates' Court	165
5.4	Criminal Jurisdiction of the Magistrates' Court	165
5.4.1	Summary offences	166
5.4.2	Indictable offences	166
5.4.3	Indictable offences triable summarily	167
5.4.4	Private prosecutions	167
5.4.5	Referral of cases to the Court of First Instance	168
5.4.6	Transfer of cases to the District Court	158
5.5	Overview of Appeals and Reviews	168
5.5.1	Diagram 1: Overview of appeals and reviews	169
5.6	Review by a Magistrate: s.104 of the Magistrates Ordinance	169
5.7	Appeal Against Conviction: s.113 of the Magistrates Ordinance	173
5.7.1	Right to appeal	173
5.7.2	Grounds for upholding appeal against conviction	174
5.7.3	Nature of the appeal	178
5.7.4	Referral by Court of First Instance to the Court of Final Appeal	179
5.8	Appeal by Offender Against Sentence: s.113 of the Magistrates Ordinance	179
5.8.1	The right to appeal sentence	179
5.8.2	Grounds for upholding sentence appeal	179
5.8.3	Disposition powers on appeal against conviction, sentence and case stated	180
5.9	General Procedure on Appeal Under s.113 of the Magistrates Ordinance	181
5.9.1	Flow chart 1: Procedure on appeal under s.113 of the Magistrates Ordinance	181
5.9.2	Notice of appeal	181
5.9.3	Statement of finding/reasons for sentence	182
5.9.4	Notice out of time	182
5.9.5	Basic appeal bundle	183
5.9.6	Additional transcript	183
5.9.7	Transmit appeal bundle to the High Court	183

5.9.8	Copy of appeal bundle served on parties	184
5.9.9	Appellant's perfected grounds of appeal	184
5.9.10	Appellant's written submissions	184
5.9.11	Respondent's written submissions	184
5.9.12	Other applications	184
5.9.13	Non-compliance with the rules	184
5.9.14	Hearing date fixed	185
5.9.15	Abandonment of appeal	185
5.9.16	Appellant in custody	185
5.9.17	Bail pending appeal	185
5.9.18	Commencement date of sentence passed on appeal	185
5.9.19	Intervention by Secretary for Justice	185
5.9.20	Procedure at the hearing of the appeal	186
5.9.21	Court of First Instance notifies the Magistrates' Court of the result	186
5.9.22	Stays	186
5.9.23	Recognition forfeited	187
5.10	Correcting Mistakes: Reopening Appeal Judgments	187
5.10.1	The perfection rule	188
5.10.2	The slip rule	189
5.10.3	The residual discretion after perfection	189
5.11	Application by Secretary for Justice for Review of Sentence Under s.81A of the Criminal Procedure Ordinance	189
5.11.1	Procedure on application	191
5.11.2	Disposition of application under s.81A	191
5.12	Appeal by Way of Case Stated: s.105 of the Magistrates Ordinance	192
5.12.1	Which decisions can be the subject of a case stated?	192
5.12.2	Grounds of the application	193
5.12.3	Who can apply?	193
5.12.4	Procedure on case stated	194
5.13	Other Types of Appeals and Reviews	196
5.13.1	Referral by the Chief Executive under s.113A of the Magistrates Ordinance	196
5.13.2	Appeal against refusal to grant bail	197
5.13.3	Application to review a grant of bail	198
5.13.4	Appeal determination that the accused is under a disability and unfit to stand trial	198
5.13.5	Appeal against a bind-over order	198
5.14	Costs in Proceedings before the Magistrates' Court	199
5.14.1	Costs in favour of the defendant	199
5.14.2	Costs in favour of the prosecution	199
5.14.3	General cost principles	200
5.14.4	Appeals against costs order	201

CHAPTER 6 APPEALS FROM THE DISTRICT COURT

6.1	Introduction	206
6.2	Applicable Appeal Rules	206
6.3	Key Sources of Law	207
6.4	Criminal Jurisdiction of the District Court	207
6.4.1	Transfer out of the District Court	208

6.5	Appeal Against Conviction	208
6.5.1	The right to appeal	208
6.5.2	Grounds of appeal	209
6.5.3	Grounds for allowing appeal against conviction	210
6.5.4	Appellate approach to an appeal against conviction	211
6.5.5	Disposition powers on an appeal against conviction	212
6.6	Appeal Against Sentence upon Indictment	214
6.6.1	Right of offender to appeal against sentence	214
6.6.2	Application by Secretary for Justice to review sentence	217
6.7	Appeal by Secretary for Justice Against Acquittal	220
6.7.1	Procedure on prosecution appeal against acquittal	221
6.8	Prohibition on Staying or Reversing Judgments or Allowing of the Appeal on Specified Grounds	222
6.9	Procedure on Application for Leave to Appeal Conviction or Sentence	223
6.9.1	Diagram 1: Application for leave to appeal conviction and sentence	223
6.9.2	Notice of application	224
6.9.3	Initial grounds of appeal	224
6.9.4	Application to extend time	224
6.9.5	Copy of notice to Secretary for Justice	224
6.9.6	Registrar obtains all necessary documents: appeal bundle	225
6.9.7	Registrar obtains trial judge's notes	225
6.9.8	Registrar obtains particulars of trial and conviction	225
6.9.9	Registrar obtains transcript	225
6.9.10	Copy of appeal bundle sent to the parties	225
6.9.11	Perfectured grounds of appeal	225
6.9.12	Registrar obtains hearing date	226
6.9.13	Determination of application	226
6.9.14	Review by Court of Appeal of dismissal	226
6.9.15	Registrar advises result	226
6.9.16	Case proceeds as appeal	226
6.10	Procedure on Appeal from the District Court	226
6.10.1	Diagram 2: Procedure on conviction (and sentence) appeal to the Court of Appeal	227
6.10.2	Notice of appeal	227
6.10.3	Copy of notice to Secretary for Justice	229
6.10.4	Disposal of groundless appeal	229
6.10.5	Registrar obtains hearing date	229
6.10.6	Registrar obtains particulars of trial and conviction	229
6.10.7	Registrar obtains all necessary documents	229
6.10.8	Registrar obtains trial judge's notes	230
6.10.9	Registrar obtains transcript	230
6.10.10	List of authorities	230
6.10.11	The hearing of the application for leave or the appeal	230
6.10.12	Determination of appeal	231
6.10.13	Delivery of judgment and reasons	231
6.10.14	Registrar advises result	231
6.10.15	Abandonment of appeal	231
6.10.16	Bail pending appeal	232

6.10.17	Non-compliance with the rules	232
6.10.18	Powers of the Court of Appeal on the appeal: fresh evidence	232
6.10.19	Powers of the Court of Appeal exercisable by a single judge of appeal	233
6.10.20	Reserved decisions or reasons	234
6.10.21	Notice of final determination	234
6.11	Effect of Appeal on Sentence Passed	235
6.11.1	Time reckoned	235
6.11.2	Restitution order	235
6.11.3	Fines	235
6.11.4	Compensation and restitution	235
6.11.5	Suspension of disqualifications	236
6.11.6	Destruction or forfeiture of property	236
6.12	Other Types of Appeals and Applications to the Court of Appeal	236
6.12.1	Appeal against a verdict of not guilty by reason of insanity	236
6.12.2	Appeal against a finding of disability	237
6.12.3	Reserve a question of law: case stated	238
6.12.4	Reference to Court of Appeal following acquittal	239
6.12.5	Appeal by Secretary for Justice against discharge of accused	239
6.12.6	Appeal bail decisions	239
6.13	Costs in Proceedings before the District Court	240
6.13.1	Costs in favour of the defendant	240
6.13.2	Costs in favour of the prosecution	241
6.13.3	General cost principles	242
6.13.4	Appeals against costs order	242

CHAPTER 7 APPEALS AND APPLICATIONS FROM THE COURT OF FIRST INSTANCE TO THE COURT OF APPEAL

7.1	Introduction	248
7.2	Key Sources of Law	248
7.3	Criminal Jurisdiction of the Court of First Instance	249
7.3.1	Transfer of cases from the District Court	249
7.3.2	Transfer of cases from the Magistrates' Court	249
7.4	Appeal Against Conviction	250
7.4.1	The right to appeal against conviction	250
7.4.2	Grounds of appeal	250
7.4.3	Grounds for allowing appeal against conviction under s.82 of the Criminal Procedure Ordinance	251
7.4.4	General observations about the grounds to uphold an appeal against conviction	252
7.4.5	The proviso	253
7.4.6	Unmeritorious applications	254
7.4.7	Can a person appeal conviction following a plea of guilty?	255
7.4.8	Right to fair trial	256
7.4.9	Appellate approach to an appeal against conviction	257
7.4.10	General approach to appeals based on fact	259
7.4.11	Unsafe or unsatisfactory conviction	259

7.4.12	Wrong decision on any question of law	287
7.4.13	A material irregularity in the course of the trial	288
7.4.14	Disposition powers on appeal against conviction	294
7.5	Appeal Against Sentence upon Indictment	299
7.5.1	Appeal against sentence by offender: s.83G of the Criminal Procedure Ordinance	299
7.5.2	Appeal by Secretary for Justice against sentence: s.81A of the Criminal Procedure Ordinance	337
7.6	Procedure on Application for Leave to Appeal Conviction or Sentence	343
7.6.1	Diagram 1: Application for leave to appeal conviction and sentence	343
7.6.2	Notice of application for leave to appeal: conviction	344
7.6.3	Notice of application for leave to appeal: sentence	344
7.6.4	Initial grounds of appeal	344
7.6.5	Notice of application to extend time to apply for leave to appeal	345
7.6.6	Copy of notice to Secretary for Justice	347
7.6.7	Application for single judge to recuse	347
7.6.8	Registrar obtains all necessary documents: appeal bundle	348
7.6.9	Registrar obtains trial judge's note	348
7.6.10	Registrar obtains particulars of trial and conviction	349
7.6.11	Registrar obtains transcript	349
7.6.12	Copy of appeal bundle sent to parties	349
7.6.13	Perfected grounds of appeal	349
7.6.14	Registrar obtains hearing date	349
7.6.15	Determination of application: reasonably arguable grounds	349
7.6.16	Loss of time order	350
7.6.17	Review by Court of Appeal of dismissal of application	352
7.6.18	Extension of time to apply for renewal of application for leave	352
7.6.19	Registrar advises result	353
7.6.20	Case proceeds as appeal	353
7.6.21	Appeal and application for leave heard and determined at the same time	353
7.7	Procedure on Appeal	354
7.7.1	Diagram 2: Procedure on conviction (and sentence) appeal to Court of Appeal	354
7.7.2	Notice of appeal	355
7.7.3	Notice out of time	356
7.7.4	Copy to Secretary for Justice	356
7.7.5	Disposal of groundless appeal	356
7.7.6	Registrar obtains hearing date	356
7.7.7	Registrar obtains particulars of trial and conviction	356
7.7.8	Registrar obtains all necessary documents	357
7.7.9	Registrar obtains trial judge's note	357
7.7.10	Registrar obtains transcript	357
7.7.11	List of authorities	357
7.7.12	Written submissions	357
7.7.13	The hearing of the application for leave or the appeal	358
7.7.14	Powers of the Court of Appeal on appeal	358
7.7.15	Determination of appeal	361
7.7.16	Delivery of judgment and reasons	361

7.7.17	Registrar advises result	361
7.7.18	Abandonment of application or appeal	361
7.7.19	Application to treat notice of abandonment as a nullity	361
7.7.20	Death of appellant prior to hearing of appeal	364
7.7.21	Bail pending appeal	365
7.7.22	Non-compliance with the rules	367
7.7.23	Powers of the Court of Appeal exercisable by a single judge of appeal	368
7.7.24	Reserved decisions or reasons	368
7.7.25	Delivery of judgment within a reasonable time	369
7.7.26	Notice of final determination	369
7.7.27	Effect of appeal on sentence passed	369
7.8	Correcting Mistakes: Reopening Appeal Judgments	371
7.8.1	The perfection rule	371
7.8.2	The slip rule	373
7.8.3	The residual discretion after perfection	373
7.9	Other Types of Appeals and Applications to the Court of Appeal	374
7.9.1	Reserve a question of law: case stated	374
7.9.2	Reference to Court of Appeal following acquittal	376
7.9.3	Prosecution appeal against discharge of accused	376
7.9.4	Prosecution appeal against quashing of indictment	377
7.9.5	Prosecution appeal against a permanent stay order	377
7.9.6	Appeal against verdict of not guilty by reason of insanity	380
7.9.7	Appeal against a finding of disability	381
7.9.8	Appeal against a confiscation/forfeiture order	382
7.9.9	Appeal against a confiscation order: bail	383
7.9.10	Petition to the Chief Executive for a pardon or commutation of sentence	383
7.9.11	Reference to Court of Appeal by Chief Executive	384
7.9.12	Appeal bail decisions	386
7.10	Costs in Proceedings in the Court of First Instance	387
7.10.1	Costs in favour of the defendant	387
7.10.2	Costs in favour of the prosecution	389
7.10.3	General cost principles	391
7.10.4	Appeals against costs order	391

CHAPTER 8 APPEALS TO THE COURT OF FINAL APPEAL

8.1	Introduction	395
8.1.1	Establishment of the Court of Final Appeal	395
8.2	Key Sources of Law	396
8.3	Role of the Court of Final Appeal	396
8.4	Criminal Jurisdiction of the Court of Final Appeal and the Right to Appeal	398
8.4.1	What is a "final decision?"	399
8.5	Leave to Appeal	400
8.5.1	The test for deciding leave to appeal	401
8.5.2	The Appeal Committee	403
8.5.3	Applications for leave: "point of law of great and general importance" limb	404

8.5.4	Applications for leave: "substantial and grave injustice" limb.....	404
8.5.5	Appellate approaches to applications for leave by the prosecution.....	406
8.5.6	Application for leave in reliance on both limbs in s.32(2).....	407
8.6	The Registrar.....	407
8.7	How Many Applications for Leave to Appeal can be Made?.....	407
8.8	Raising New Points on Appeal not Raised Below.....	408
8.9	Relationship Between Grounds for Leave to Appeal and Final Disposition of an Appeal.....	408
8.10	Procedure on Application to Appeal Committee for Leave to Appeal.....	409
8.10.1	Diagram 1: Procedure on application to Appeal Committee for leave to appeal.....	409
8.10.2	File notice of application for leave to appeal.....	410
8.10.3	Extension of time.....	411
8.10.4	Service of notice.....	411
8.10.5	Rule 7 procedure.....	411
8.10.6	Procedure where respondent consents to one ground but not all grounds.....	411
8.10.7	Hearing date set.....	412
8.10.8	File skeleton arguments.....	412
8.10.9	Withdrawal of application.....	413
8.10.10	Hearing of application.....	413
8.11	Procedure on Appeal.....	413
8.11.1	Diagram 2: Procedure on Appeal.....	414
8.11.2	Notice of appeal filed.....	415
8.11.3	Registration.....	415
8.11.4	Service.....	415
8.11.5	Withdrawal of Notice of appeal.....	416
8.11.6	Dismissal for want of prosecution.....	416
8.11.7	Notice of appearance by respondent.....	416
8.11.8	Non-appearance of respondent.....	416
8.11.9	Filing of case.....	417
8.11.10	Respondent to file case.....	417
8.11.11	Contents of case.....	417
8.11.12	The Record.....	418
8.11.13	Filing and serving Part A.....	418
8.11.14	Approval of Part B by respondent.....	418
8.11.15	Approval of Part B by Registrar.....	418
8.11.16	Directions by Registrar.....	418
8.11.17	Hearing date appointed.....	418
8.11.18	List of Authorities filed.....	419
8.11.19	Withdrawal of appeal.....	419
8.12	Uncontested Applications and Appeals: Determination on the Papers.....	419
8.13	The Appeal Hearing.....	421
8.13.1	Admissibility of fresh evidence on appeal.....	421
8.13.2	Disposition powers of the court.....	422
8.13.3	Retrial.....	422
8.13.4	The Judgment.....	423
8.13.5	Non-compliance with the rules.....	423
8.14	Bail.....	424
8.14.1	Detention on appeal by prosecutor.....	425

8.15	Effect of Appeal on Sentence.....	425
8.16	Death of Appellant.....	425
8.17	Reopening an Appeal.....	426

Appendix

Practice Direction 2.2	Criminal Appeals to the Court of Final Appeal.....	427
Practice Direction 2.4	Court of Final Appeal — Time Management.....	429
Practice Direction 4.2	Criminal Appeals to the Court of Appeal.....	433
Practice Direction 4.3	Criminal Appeals in the Court of Appeal — Handing down judgments.....	441
Practice Direction 5.5	Submission of Authorities.....	443
Practice Direction 9.6	Magistracy Appeals in the Court of First Instance.....	445
Practice Direction 9.7	Applications to Stay Criminal Proceedings.....	449
Practice Direction 10.3	Citation of Judgments Written in Chinese at Hearings Conducted in English.....	451
Practice Direction SL4	Practice Note (Crime: Sentence: Loss of Time).....	453

<i>Select Bibliography</i>	455
----------------------------------	-----

<i>Index</i>	459
--------------------	-----