

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>Also by</i>	vii
<i>Preface</i>	ix
<i>Author information</i>	xxiii
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xxvii
<i>Table of Statutes</i>	xciii
Part 1 – Introduction	1
Chapter 1.0: Introduction	3
Purpose and scope	3
Law reform activity	4
Rules of admissibility.....	5
An overview of an expert's participation in litigation	6
Issues for the future	13
Part 2 – Common law evidentiary rules	15
Chapter 2.0: The common law exclusionary rules of expert evidence . 17	
The rules	17
The role of the expert witness.....	18
Anxieties generating the rules' development	20
The exclusionary rules in family law litigation.....	22
Role of exclusionary rules outside criminal and civil litigation	23
Discretionary exclusion.....	27
Judicial notice.....	28
Chapter 2.5: The expertise rule	29
The role of the expert	29
The expertise rule: expert's must be experts.....	33
Increased rigour in application of expertise rule	34
Independence of experts	35
The unrepresentativeness of an expert's views	36
Unusual nature of expertise	37
Inferences of expertise from expert reports	37
Ad hoc expertise	38
Application of the expertise rule.....	38
Legislative definitions	43
The United States approach	45
Existence of formal qualifications.....	45
The expert on foreign law	53
Chapter 2.10: The area of expertise rule	57
An exclusionary rule?	57
The approach of Madden CJ	58
The Frye test.....	59
Reliability and the area of expertise test: English and Welsh authority.....	60
Reliability and the area of expertise test: Australian authority	62
United States controversy over the Frye test.....	66
United States case law interpreting the Frye test.....	68
The Daubert test	72
Post-Daubert decisions	75

United States Federal law reform.....	78
New Zealand authority	78
Canadian authority	81
Likely developments in Australasia	85
Chapter 2.15: The common knowledge rule.....	87
The common knowledge exclusion.....	87
The common knowledge rule: the traditional formulation.....	88
The common knowledge rule: a more flexible formulation.....	91
Counterintuitive evidence	94
Rationales for the common knowledge rule	97
The normal versus abnormal dichotomy	99
Murphy v The Queen.....	101
The law after Murphy v The Queen	104
Expert evidence of intoxication by alcohol.....	107
Expert evidence on memory and identification	107
Expert evidence on community standards, human nature and understanding.....	107
Expert evidence on the meaning of words.....	111
Expert evidence on foreign law.....	116
Evidence of professional practice.....	117
Expert evidence in passing off cases	117
Appendix: Potential areas of expert evidence by mental health professionals.....	120
Chapter 2.20: The basis rule.....	121
The issue.....	121
The significance of the issue	122
The underlying inconsistency.....	123
The controversy: a basis rule of exclusion or a matter of weight?.....	126
The basis rule of exclusion	128
United Kingdom authorities	130
A matter of weight	136
The rule against self-serving evidence.....	140
Acceptable bases of expert evidence	140
Contemporaneous statements as to health, made to an expert	143
Unacceptable bases of expert evidence	144
Persuasive presentation of expert evidence.....	145
Chapter 2.25: The ultimate issue rule	147
The rule	147
Uncertainty of formulation.....	149
The traditional formulation	152
The Eggleston formulation	153
Criticism of the rule.....	153
A variation on the traditional formulation.....	154
Expert evidence involving legal standards.....	154
An exception – civil, non-jury cases	158
Family Court litigation.....	159
A warning about circumvention.....	160
Diminished responsibility evidence in New South Wales.....	160
Canadian evolution of the law.....	160
United States evolution of the rule.....	160
Chapter 2.30: Judicial notice.....	163
An alternative to expert evidence?.....	163
Matters of common knowledge.....	164
The primary parameter for judicial notice	164
Departure from strict principle	165
The fluid nature of judicial notice.....	167
Reference to works of authority	168

Legislative instruments	169
Ramifications for expert evidence	169
Chapter 2.35: Discretionary exclusion of expert evidence	171
The prejudice/probative discretion under the criminal law.....	171
The prejudice/probative discretion under the civil law.....	172
Common law interpretation of the prejudice/probative discretion.....	173
United States discretionary exclusion.....	181
Discretionary exclusion on the ground of the unavailability of the expert's work for scrutiny	182
Permanent stay for abuse of process.....	183
Discretionary exclusion on the basis of incomprehensibility or irrationality.....	184
Unfairness discretion.....	184
Exclusion on the basis of prosecution non-disclosure of expert testing.....	185
Discretionary exclusion on the ground of bias	186
Part 3 – Statutory evidentiary rules.....	189
Chapter 3.0: Statutory law in Australia.....	191
Introduction	191
Specialised knowledge.....	194
Behaviour, competency and development of children.....	200
Chapter 3.5: Statutory law in New Zealand	221
Background to the 2006 legislation.....	221
The 2006 legislation	223
Chapter 3.10: Statutory law in the United States	227
Statutory law in the United States	227
Court-appointed experts.....	229
Discretionary exclusion of evidence.....	230
Chapter 3.15: Law reform proposals.....	231
International law reform proposals	231
Part 4 – Appeals	241
Chapter 4.0: Appeals in relation to expert evidence	243
Appeals against determinations on admissibility	244
Role of the tribunal of fact	245
Approach of appellate courts in civil matters	247
The fallacy of inevitable error when experts disagree.....	249
When expert evidence is uncontradicted.....	250
Conflicts and reasonable hypotheses.....	251
Judicial directions to juries	253
The Shepherd direction	254
Use of expert as filter	255
Experts exceeding proper parameters	256
Part 5 – Procedure	275
Chapter 5.0: Forensic reports	277
Introduction	277
Strengths and weaknesses in forensic reports	278
Commissioning of reports.....	280

Obligations to the court.....	281
Contingency fees.....	281
No property in an expert.....	282
Expert reports: definitions.....	282
Medical reports: treaters and assessors.....	283
Content of reports.....	284
Draft reports.....	288
Shadow expert reports/consulting expert reports.....	289
Supplementary reports.....	289
Lawyers settling expert reports.....	290
Pre-trial exchange of expert reports.....	291
Obligation to submit to expert medical examination.....	293
Failure to serve expert material.....	294
Expert evidence via the certification procedure.....	295
Disclosure of expert evidence in criminal cases.....	296
The implied undertaking.....	298
Chapter 5.5: Court rules.....	301
Introduction.....	301
Enforcement of Court Rules for expert witnesses.....	301
Further experts in addition to single experts.....	306
Disciplinary ramifications for poor forensic work.....	307
Ethical obligations.....	307
Common law decisions on the ethical obligations of expert witnesses.....	308
Chapter 5.15: Costs and client legal privilege.....	313
Costs.....	313
Experts and protection of trade secrets.....	314
Privilege.....	316
Draft reports.....	323
Breach of confidentiality by experts.....	327
Chapter 5.20: Remuneration of experts.....	333
Remuneration of experts.....	333
Award of expert fees by courts.....	333
Contractual obligations of solicitors.....	335
English authority.....	335
Expert witnesses' expenses.....	337
United States authority.....	338
Medico-Legal Joint Standing Committee of the Law Institute of Victoria.....	338
Contingency fees for experts.....	339
Part 6 – Expert witnesses and decision making.....	343
Chapter 6.0: Court-appointed experts.....	345
Introduction.....	345
Court-appointed experts.....	346
Courts' power to call experts.....	348
Controversies over court appointment of expert witnesses.....	353
Chapter 6.5: Assessors.....	355
Introduction.....	355
Assessors.....	356
Use of assessors.....	356
The status of assessors' advice.....	358
The role of the assessor.....	360
Controversies over the use of assessors.....	361
Canadian practice.....	362

Chapter 6.10: Referees.....	365
Introduction.....	365
Preliminary.....	368
The conduct of the referee's inquiry.....	373
The adoption or rejection of the referee's report by the trial judge.....	377
Chapter 6.15: Concurrent expert evidence.....	391
Introduction.....	391
The background.....	392
Procedures for concurrent expert evidence.....	393
Procedures for expert conclaves.....	395
Concurrent evidence in the courts.....	396
Concurrent evidence before administrative tribunals.....	397
Controversies.....	398
Concurrent evidence orders.....	401
The future.....	406
Part 7 – Expert evidence in court.....	409
Chapter 7.5: Preparation, examination- in-chief and re-examination of the expert witness.....	411
Introduction.....	411
Advice to expert witnesses before court.....	413
Exclusion of expert witnesses.....	424
Demonstrating appropriate expertise.....	425
Bias.....	427
Language.....	431
Bases of evidence.....	432
The hypothetical question.....	434
Evidence of speculation.....	435
Eliciting of evidence.....	436
Use of diagrams, slides and other forms of demonstrative exhibit.....	437
Evidence of experiments.....	441
Avoidance of admissibility traps.....	445
Re-examination of the expert witness.....	446
Chapter 7.10: Cross-examination of the expert witness.....	449
Introduction.....	449
The role of cross-examination.....	450
Conferences by counsel with expert witnesses.....	454
Challenging the expert's qualifications.....	456
Arguing with the witness or the advocate.....	458
Tried and tested cross-examination techniques.....	459
Dealing with hypothetical questions.....	482
Examination of the expert's notes.....	482
Chapter 7.15: Sentencing evidence of the expert witness.....	485
The role of the expert.....	485
Expert evidence in mitigation.....	487
Expert evidence for the prosecution.....	511
Prediction of dangerousness.....	513
Expert evidence as to the nature of the offence.....	516

Part 8 – Liability of experts	519
Chapter 8.5: Criminal and civil liability of expert witnesses and report writers	521
Introduction	521
Civil liability for expert witnesses: the immunity rule	522
Traditional English authority	532
Reforming English authority	535
Scottish authority	542
United States authority	542
Canadian authority	543
New Zealand authority	544
Australian authority	544
Criminal liability for experts	546
Chapter 8.10: Regulatory liability of expert witnesses and report writers	549
Introduction	549
United Kingdom authorities	550
United States authorities	558
Australian authorities	559
The role of regulatory bodies	562
Timing of investigations by regulators	563
Part 9 – Medical, dental and nursing evidence	565
Chapter 9.5: Medical evidence	567
Introduction	567
Causation	569
Fibromyalgia and chronic pain syndrome.....	571
Unorthodox treatments	572
Aetiology of cancer.....	573
Aetiology of HIV/AIDS	574
Pathologists' evidence on injury causation.....	580
Pathologists' evidence in SIDS cases.....	583
Chapter 9.10: Dental evidence	591
Introduction	591
Dental evidence in the Chamberlain Case	591
Bitemark evidence	593
Chapter 9.15: Nursing evidence	599
Introduction	599
Nurses as experts.....	599
Forensic nurses as experts.....	600
Part 10 – Mental health evidence	603
Chapter 10.5: Psychiatrists' and psychologists' evidence: general principles	605
Introduction	605
The parameters of mental health professionals' expertise	606
Diagnostic expertise of psychologists	606
Bases of mental health expert testimony	612
Expert evidence on intellectual impairment	612
Mental health expert evidence about normal persons.....	615

The repercussions of <i>Murphy v The Queen</i>	618
Mental health expert evidence about children.....	621
Mental health expert evidence about child development and child behaviour.....	621
Mental health expert evidence as to character, credit and credibility	622
Expert evidence about truthfulness and lying.....	633
Mental health expert evidence about behaviour	659
Chapter 10.10: Fitness for interview evidence	663
Introduction	663
Fitness for interview	664
Legal framework.....	666
Expert assessments	670
Chapter 10.15: Fitness to stand trial evidence	677
Introduction	677
Fitness to stand trial.....	678
Legal framework.....	678
Expert assessments	687
Chapter 10.20: Identification evidence	701
Expert evidence on eyewitness identification and voice identification.....	701
Eyewitness identification evidence.....	702
Voice identification evidence.....	712
Chapter 10.25: Memory evidence	721
Introduction	721
Expert evidence on the operation of memory	721
Australian authority.....	723
United Kingdom authority	726
Canadian authority	731
The parameters of likely admission.....	732
Hypnotically enhanced or refreshed evidence.....	733
Chapter 10.30: Mental state evidence	747
Introduction	747
Expert evidence on intent	747
Expert evidence about insanity/mental impairment	752
Expert evidence about diminished responsibility	757
Expert evidence about automatism/involuntariness	762
Expert evidence about provocation	764
Expert evidence about testamentary capacity	764
Chapter 10.35: Syndrome evidence	771
Introduction	772
Psychological syndromes	772
Battered woman syndrome evidence	774
Rape trauma syndrome evidence.....	797
Battered child/shaken baby syndrome evidence.....	803
Child Sexual Abuse Accommodation Syndrome (CSAAS) evidence	805
Likely Australasian developments	825
Repressed memory syndrome and false memory syndrome evidence.....	827
Premenstrual syndrome evidence	848
Parental alienation syndrome evidence.....	852
Chapter 10.40: Profiling evidence	863
Introduction	863
The psychological autopsy/equivocal death analysis	866
The impediments to admissibility	868
United Kingdom authority	869
Australian authority.....	871

Canadian authority.....	873
Criminal profiling/crime scene analysis evidence.....	879
A limited future for profiling evidence.....	882
Chapter 10.45: Prediction of risk evidence.....	885
Introduction.....	885
An overview of commonly used actuarial instruments.....	898
Chapter 10.50: Post-traumatic stress disorder evidence.....	931
Introduction.....	932
Development of PTSD criteria.....	935
DSM and ICD PTSD criteria.....	937
Difficult relationship with assessment instruments.....	954
Compensability of psychiatric injuries in Australia.....	954
Current status of PTSD in the law.....	958
Diagnostic issues.....	977
PTSD and criminal law.....	977
PTSD and its challenge for the law.....	980
Chapter 10.55: Critical incident stress intervention evidence.....	983
Introduction.....	984
Critical incident stress intervention: debriefing.....	984
Critical incident stress intervention: the controversy.....	988
Civil actions for inadequate response to psychogenic trauma.....	991
The evolving law.....	999
Part 11 – Social scientists’ evidence.....	1001
Chapter 11.5: Survey evidence.....	1003
Introduction.....	1003
Admissibility of survey evidence.....	1004
Early Australian civil authorities on survey evidence.....	1009
The use of survey evidence in criminal cases.....	1011
Later Australian civil authority permitting survey evidence.....	1029
An English note of caution.....	1038
Principles arising from the case law.....	1038
Chapter 11.10: Historians’ evidence.....	1045
Introduction.....	1045
Diverse examples of historians’ evidence in the courts.....	1045
Factual history and social history.....	1046
Nature of history.....	1047
Qualifications as an historian.....	1047
Objectivity.....	1048
Native title cases.....	1048
Planning cases.....	1049
Veterans’ pension entitlement cases.....	1049
Statutory provisions.....	1050
Chapter 11.15: Anthropologists’ evidence.....	1051
Introduction.....	1051
Expertise.....	1054
The bases of anthropologists’ evidence.....	1054
Avoidance of advocacy.....	1060
Distinction between facts and opinions.....	1060
Discretionary exclusion.....	1061
Role of lawyers.....	1061
Self-referential reports.....	1061

Gender restriction issues.....	1061
Compliance with ethical codes.....	1062
Chapter 11.20: Cultural experts’ evidence.....	1063
Introduction.....	1063
Criminal law.....	1064
Family law matters.....	1064
Native title claims.....	1066
Chapter 11.25: Linguists’ evidence.....	1067
Introduction.....	1067
Meaning of words.....	1067
Voluntariness of confessions or admissions.....	1068
Trademark cases.....	1068
Immigration and refugee claims.....	1070
Native title claims.....	1070
Part 12 – Scientists’ evidence.....	1073
Chapter 12.5: Scientific evidence.....	1075
Introduction.....	1075
Controversies.....	1076
The status of scientific evidence.....	1077
Scientific evidence as circumstantial evidence.....	1078
Epidemiology and evidence of possibility in civil cases.....	1081
Seltsam Pty Ltd v McGuinness.....	1082
Evaluation of scientific evidence.....	1083
Continuity of evidence.....	1084
Computer simulations.....	1086
Destruction of exhibits.....	1086
Scientific instruments: the presumption of accuracy.....	1087
The National Measurement Act 1960 (Cth).....	1090
Facilitation of proof.....	1091
Chapter 12.10: Novel scientific evidence.....	1093
Introduction.....	1093
The obligation of the party adducing novel scientific evidence at common law.....	1094
Photographic and x-ray evidence.....	1095
Fingerprinting evidence.....	1096
Polygraphy evidence.....	1097
Voice identification evidence.....	1097
Downloading of data from mobile phones.....	1098
DNA profiling evidence.....	1098
Psychological autopsy evidence.....	1099
Child sexual abuse accommodation syndrome evidence.....	1099
Facial mapping/body mapping evidence.....	1100
Lip-reading evidence.....	1108
Ear print comparison evidence.....	1111
Chapter 12.15: Fingerprinting, footprint and footwear evidence.....	1113
Introduction.....	1113
Settled law relating to fingerprinting.....	1114
Experts as convenient helpers.....	1116
Other authorities.....	1118
United Kingdom authority.....	1119
Fabrication/transposition of fingerprints.....	1119
United States case authority.....	1121
Footprint evidence.....	1125

Barefoot impression evidence.....	1125
Shoeprint impression evidence.....	1125
Resemblance evidence.....	1126
Shoe evidence.....	1126
Biometric identification evidence.....	1127
Assessing fingerprint and associated evidence.....	1127
Chapter 12.20: Document analysis evidence.....	1129
Introduction.....	1129
Area of expertise.....	1129
Presentation of evidence.....	1130
Disputed evidence.....	1130
The control document.....	1130
Basis of evidence.....	1132
Availability of disputed document for jury.....	1132
Judicial warnings.....	1133
United States post-Daubert developments.....	1133
Chapter 12.25: DNA profiling evidence.....	1135
Introduction.....	1135
Applications of DNA profiling.....	1136
Presentation of DNA evidence.....	1137
Limitations of DNA profiling.....	1142
The future for the admissibility of DNA profiling evidence.....	1157
Checklist for DNA cross-examiners.....	1159
Summary of methodology problems highlighted by decisions.....	1160
Key cases from Australia and Britain.....	1161
Historical development.....	1173
Chapter 12.30: Statistical evidence.....	1197
Introduction.....	1197
DNA evidence.....	1200
Rejection of Bayesian Analysis.....	1203
Epidemiology evidence.....	1208
Ethical Responsibilities in the Use of Statistics.....	1216
Part 13 – Police evidence.....	1217
Chapter 13.5: Police evidence.....	1219
Introduction.....	1219
The risk of prejudice.....	1219
Expertise in relation to drug supply, cultivation and consumer practices.....	1220
Subgroup activities.....	1221
Meaning of drug culture words.....	1222
Meaning of street jargon.....	1223
Evidence about crime scene investigation.....	1224
Effects of intoxication.....	1224
Engagement in counter-surveillance techniques.....	1226
Identification of voices.....	1226
Identification from CCTV Footage.....	1227
Evidence by dog handlers.....	1228
Behaviour of prison escapees.....	1228
Re-enactments/experiments.....	1228
Ballistics evidence.....	1228
Fingerprinting evidence.....	1230

Chapter 13.10: Tracker and sniffer dog evidence.....	1231
Introduction.....	1231
The case authorities.....	1232
Internationally accepted requirements for admissibility of tracker dog evidence.....	1242
Search by dogs.....	1242
Part 14 – Accident reconstruction evidence.....	1245
Chapter 14.5: Accident reconstruction evidence.....	1247
Introduction.....	1247
Parameters of expertise.....	1247
Calculation of vehicle speed.....	1249
Calculation of friction co-efficients.....	1249
Course of a vehicle.....	1249
Part 15 – Financial evidence.....	1251
Chapter 15.5: Valuation evidence.....	1253
Introduction.....	1253
Methodology.....	1254
Making adjustments.....	1256
Market value and special value.....	1256
Valuation of land.....	1258
Valuation where experts disagree.....	1261
Chapter 15.10: Financial evidence.....	1263
Introduction.....	1263
Admissibility in principle.....	1264
General admissibility principles.....	1264
Expertise.....	1264
Common knowledge rule.....	1268
Methodology issues: probative value of evidence.....	1269
Orderly and clear presentation: potential for prejudice.....	1271
Accessibility of evidence: superannuation calculation by actuaries.....	1272
Opinions based on assumed facts.....	1272
Hypothetical facts.....	1273
Delineation of reasoning processes.....	1273
Proof of bases.....	1274
Reference to material discounted or rejected.....	1276
Delegation of work by an expert.....	1277
Multiple experts.....	1277
Advocacy.....	1277
Ultimate issue rule.....	1278
Questions of law.....	1278
Discretionary exclusion for bias.....	1279
Interpretive evidence from an economic perspective.....	1280
Forensic Accounting Services: APES 215.....	1281
Part 16 – Planning evidence.....	1285
Chapter 16.5: Quantity surveyors' evidence.....	1287
Introduction.....	1287
The Australian Institute of Quantity Surveyors Expert Witness Register.....	1287
Expertise of quantity surveyors.....	1288

Evidence about cost to complete.....	1288
The need for objectivity	1289
Chapter 16.10: Planning and environmental impact evidence.....	1291
Introduction.....	1291
Role of planning witnesses.....	1291
Required neutrality.....	1292
Specificity of specialised knowledge.....	1293
Weight of evidence.....	1293
Expert conclaves and concurrent evidence	1293
Restrictions on expert evidence	1293
Part 17 – Intellectual property evidence.....	1295
Chapter 17.5: Evidence as to patents	1297
Introduction.....	1297
<i>Bibliography</i>	1303
<i>Index</i>	1395

AUTHOR INFORMATION

Ian Freckelton SC

BA (Hons) LLB (Syd), PhD (Griff), Dip Th M (ANH) FAAL, FASSA, FACLM (Hon)

Dr Freckelton has authored almost most of the legal chapters, co-authoring several with Hugh Selby.

Dr Freckelton has been a barrister in full-time practice in Victoria since 1988. He is a member of the Victorian and Tasmanian Bars. He was appointed Senior Counsel in 2007. He practises from Crockett Chambers in Melbourne and is admitted in Victoria, New South Wales, Queensland, South Australia, the Northern Territory, Tasmania and the Australian Capital Territory. His practice is principally in the administrative law, criminal law, compensation law, commercial law and coronial law areas, both at appellate and trial levels, and also in an advisory capacity.

Dr Freckelton has served as a member of the Social Security Appeals Tribunal (1989–1993), Medical Practitioners Board of Victoria (2000–2006), the Psychologists Registration Board of Victoria (1999–2007), the Psychosurgery Review Board of Victoria (1997–2005, 2009–2014), the Mental Health Review Board of Victoria (1996–2016), the Disciplinary Appeals Board of Victoria, (2005–2010), the Suitability Panel of Victoria (2007–2013), the Investigation Review Panel of Victoria (2008–2011) and the Northern Football League Tribunal (2008). He is a member of the Board of the Council of Australian Tribunals (Victorian branch). He is an inaugural member of Victoria's Coronial Council, a member of the Netherlands Centre of Forensic Expertise, and an elected fellow of the Australian Academy of Law and of the Academy of Social Sciences, Australia. He is an Honorary Fellow of the Australasian College of Legal Medicine.

Dr Freckelton is a Professorial Fellow in the Law Faculty and the Department of Psychiatry at the University of Melbourne. He is an Adjunct Professor in the Law Faculty at Monash University and at the National Institute of Public Health and Mental Health Research at Auckland University of Technology. He has previously held honorary professorial appointments at Sydney, La Trobe and Macquarie Universities.

He has been the Chief Examiner for the Law Institute of Victoria's assessment for specialisation of criminal law solicitors since 2007. Dr Freckelton was awarded honorary life member status of the Australian and New Zealand Association of Psychiatry, Psychology and Law, having served as its Transnational President between 1991 and 1997. In addition, Dr Freckelton is the Australasian Vice-President of the International Association of Law and Mental Health.

He is the editor of volumes of *The Laws of Australia* on Sentencing and on Criminal Procedure (LBC Information Services, 1993); *Police in Our Society* (with H Selby) (Butterworths, 1988); *Decisions of the Mental Health Review Board* (Vol 2) (1998); *Victorian Criminal Law, Investigation and Procedure* (six-volume looseleaf service) (LBC Information Services, 2000); *Expert Evidence* (six-volume looseleaf service) (Thomson Reuters, 1993–current); *Controversies in Health Law* (with K Petersen) (Federation Press, 1999);