

# *Table of Contents*

|   |       |
|---|-------|
| <i>Foreword by Bruno de Witte</i> .....   | v     |
| <i>Acknowledgements</i> .....   | vii   |
| <i>Table of Cases</i> .....   | xv    |
| <i>Table of Legislation</i> .....   | xxiii |
| <i>Table of Institutional Documents</i> .....   | xli   |
| <br>  |       |
| 1. Introduction.....  | 1     |
| I. Setting the Scene: A Fundamental Rights Policy in the Internal Market? .....   | 1     |
| II. Methodology.....  | 6     |
| III. Analysis.....  | 8     |
| A. The Internal Market Competence and Fundamental Rights.....   | 8     |
| B. <i>Ex Ante</i> Fundamental Rights Tools .....  | 8     |
| C. Data Protection .....  | 9     |
| D. Freedom of Expression .....  | 10    |
| E. Fundamental Labour Rights.....   | 12    |
| F. The Right to Health .....  | 13    |
| IV. Conclusion .....  | 14    |
| <br>  |       |
| 2. Competence .....   | 15    |
| I. Introduction.....  | 15    |
| II. Harmonising Fundamental Rights Under Article 114 TFEU .....   | 15    |
| A. A Horizontal Fundamental Rights Competence .....   | 16    |
| B. Article 114 TFEU and the Court's Case Law .....  | 19    |
| i. Harmonisation Under Article 114 TFEU:<br>Basic Principles .....  | 19    |
| ii. Within the Scope of Article 114 TFEU (ex Art 95 EC):<br>Improving the Conditions for the Establishment and<br>Functioning of the Internal Market..... | 21    |
| III. Conclusion .....   | 30    |
| <br>  |       |
| 3. New Mechanisms for Fundamental Rights Protection in EU Legislation:<br>Building a Fundamental Rights Culture Outside the Courts .....                  | 32    |
| I. Introduction.....  | 32    |
| II. Evolution .....   | 35    |
| III. The Fundamental Rights Scrutiny Tools in Detail.....   | 38    |
| A. The Commission.....  | 38    |
| i. Pre-Legislative Scrutiny/Fundamental Rights Mainstreaming:<br>Impact Assessments .....   | 38    |
| ii. Legislative Scrutiny/Compatibility Assessments:<br>Recitals and Explanatory Memoranda .....   | 51    |
| iii. Monitoring Compliance: Charter Compliance<br>Throughout the Legislative Process .....  | 65    |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| B. The European Parliament.....   | 66  |
| C. The Council.....   | 72  |
| D. The FRA.....   | 75  |
| IV. Conclusion .....  | 86  |
| 4. Data Protection .....  | 90  |
| I. Introduction.....  | 90  |
| II. Data Protection as a Fundamental Right.....   | 91  |
| A. The ECHR Approach vis-a-vis the EU Approach .....  | 91  |
| B. An Autonomous Definition of the Right to<br>Data Privacy in the EU? .....  | 94  |
| III. Regulating Data Protection: The Data Protection Directive<br>and the e-Privacy Directive .....   | 97  |
| A. The Data Protection Directive 95/46/EC.....  | 97  |
| i. Legislative History .....  | 97  |
| ii. The Provisions .....  | 100 |
| iii. Enforcement, Harmonisation and Policy Development<br>Through (New) Bodies of Governance .....  | 101 |
| B. The e-Privacy Directive 2002/58/EC.....  | 105 |
| i. Legislative History .....  | 105 |
| ii. The Provisions .....  | 106 |
| C. Limits to the Autonomous Definition of the<br>Right to Data Protection: The Directives and<br>Conflicting Fundamental Rights.....                            | 107 |
| i. <i>Promusicae</i> : Clashing Fundamental Rights in<br>Clashing Directives .....  | 108 |
| ii. <i>Satamedia</i> : Clashing Fundamental Rights<br>within the DPD .....  | 111 |
| iii. Making Sense of the Court's Abstaining<br>Approach (or Not).....   | 114 |
| iv. A New Direction in the Case Law Away<br>from Abstention? .....  | 119 |
| IV. Regulating Restrictions to Data Protection:<br>The (Invalidated) Data Retention Directive 2006/24/EC .....  | 129 |
| A. The Provisions.....  | 130 |
| B. Challenges to the DRD .....  | 131 |
| V. Proposal for a Coherent Data Protection Framework<br>for the Twenty-First Century: Moving Away from the<br>Internal Market, Moving Closer to Autonomy? ..... | 136 |
| VI. Conclusions.....  | 141 |
| 5. Freedom of Expression .....  | 143 |
| I. Introduction.....  | 143 |
| II. Media Pluralism—How the Regulatory Process Can Fail .....   | 143 |
| III. The Audiovisual Media Services Directive—Promoting<br>Freedom of Expression/to Provide Services .....  | 156 |

|      |   |     |
|------|---|-----|
| IV.  | Regulating Commercial Expression in the Internal Market.....  | 165 |
| A.   | Commercial Expression—What is the Status in EU Law? .....   | 165 |
| B.   | Advertising Regulation: An Assessment Through the<br>Fundamental Rights Lens .....  | 167 |
|      | i. Content-Based Rules .....  | 168 |
|      | ii. Content-Neutral Rules .....   | 183 |
| C.   | Conclusion .....  | 188 |
| 6.   | Fundamental Labour Rights.....  | 191 |
| I.   | Introduction.....   | 191 |
| II.  | The Right to Fair and Just Working Conditions in the<br>Posted Workers Directive 96/71/EC.....  | 191 |
| A.   | Legislative History of the PWD .....  | 192 |
|      | i. Background.....  | 192 |
|      | ii. The PWD—Has the Instrument been Conceived in<br>Fundamental Rights Terms? Can it be so Conceived? .....   | 194 |
| B.   | The Legislator's Balancing Exercise in the PWD .....  | 196 |
|      | i. How is 'Fair Competition' Achieved or<br>'Unfair Competition' Avoided? .....   | 197 |
|      | ii. How is Respect for the Rights of Workers Achieved?.....   | 198 |
|      | iii. How (if at all) is the Free Movement of Services<br>Promoted/Ensured? Is the PWD Legitimately Based<br>on (ex) Article 47(2) and 55 EC? .....          | 199 |
| C.   | The Judicial Intervention: <i>Laval, Rüffert</i> and<br><i>Commission v Luxembourg</i> .....  | 200 |
|      | i. The Court's Assessment in <i>Laval</i> .....   | 201 |
|      | ii. The Court's Assessment in <i>Rüffert</i> : Posted Workers<br>and Public Procurement.....  | 202 |
|      | iii. The Court's Assessment in <i>Commission v Luxembourg</i> .....   | 207 |
| D.   | The Political Response .....  | 209 |
|      | i. Deviating from the Judicial Interpretation:<br>The Position of the European Parliament .....   | 209 |
|      | ii. Endorsing the Judicial Interpretation: The Commission<br>and the Council .....  | 211 |
|      | iii. The Commission's IA Report.....  | 213 |
|      | iv. The Resulting PWED: Leaving the Substance of the<br>PWD Intact .....  | 216 |
| E.   | Conclusion .....  | 218 |
| III. | The Right to Take Collective Action and its Reconciliation<br>with Economic Freedoms.....   | 218 |
| A.   | The Right to Take Collective Action in EU and<br>International Case Law .....   | 219 |
|      | i. The Right to Take Collective Action in EU Law:<br><i>Viking</i> and <i>Laval</i> .....   | 219 |
|      | ii. The Fundamental Right to Take Collective Action,<br>Including the Right to Strike and its Reconciliation<br>with the Economic Freedoms Post-Lisbon..... | 224 |

|      |   |     |
|------|---|-----|
| iii. | The Legislative Approach: ‘Saving’ the Right to Take Collective Action from the Economic Freedoms?—Monti I, Monti II, Services and Posted Workers.....          | 229 |
| B.   | Conclusion .....  | 240 |
| IV.  | Final Conclusion.....   | 241 |
| 7.   | Health .....  | 242 |
| I.   | Introduction.....   | 242 |
| A.   | Health in the Internal Market.....  | 242 |
| B.   | Questions of Inquiry and Areas of Examination .....   | 244 |
| II.  | Public Health versus Health as a Fundamental Human Right.....   | 246 |
| A.   | The Definitional Exercise.....  | 246 |
| i.   | Public Health Policy .....  | 246 |
| ii.  | The Fundamental Human Right to Health .....   | 247 |
| B.   | Differences, Similarities and the Preferred Approach .....  | 250 |
| III. | Market–Health Harmonisation Practice and the Role of Fundamental Rights .....   | 255 |
| A.   | Orphan Medicinal Products: Regulation (EC) No 141/2000 .....  | 255 |
| i.   | The Motives for Market Intervention.....  | 255 |
| ii.  | The Fundamental Rights Dimension .....  | 257 |
| B.   | Tobacco Control Regulation.....   | 261 |
| i.   | The Motives for Market Intervention.....  | 262 |
| ii.  | The Fundamental Rights Dimension .....  | 270 |
| C.   | Patient Mobility: Directive 2011/24/EU on the Application of Patients’ Rights in Cross-Border Healthcare .....  | 283 |
| i.   | The Motives for Market Intervention .....   | 283 |
| ii.  | The Fundamental Rights Dimension .....  | 286 |
| IV.  | Conclusion .....  | 290 |
| 8.   | Conclusions.....  | 292 |
| I.   | Harmonising Fundamental Rights Protection Through the Internal Market .....   | 292 |
| II.  | Existing Harmonisation Practice .....   | 292 |
| A.   | Fundamental Rights Regulation: Existent but to a Great Extent not Explicit/Visible.....   | 293 |
| B.   | Determinants of the Role of Fundamental Rights in Internal Market Legislation .....   | 294 |
| i.   | Political Context .....   | 295 |
| ii.  | The Sensitivity of Constitutional Context.....  | 298 |
| iii. | The Institutional Apparatus (Mainstreaming Fundamental Rights through IAs and <i>ex ante</i> Fundamental Rights Compatibility Assessments of Legislation) ..... | 299 |
| iv.  | The Incentives Provided by the Court.....   | 300 |
| v.   | The Type of Right Affected .....  | 300 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| C. Consequences of Adopting a Fundamental Rights Approach .....  | 301 |
| i. The Absence of a Fundamental Rights Conceptualisation<br>does not Necessarily Lead to a Violation of Fundamental<br>Rights Standards in the Legislation ..... | 302 |
| ii. A Fundamental Rights Conceptualisation may not<br>Always Provide Added Value .....   | 302 |
| iii. The Correlation Between a Fundamental Rights<br>Conceptualisation and a Higher Standard of<br>Fundamental Rights Protection .....                           | 303 |
| iv. Is there any Impact on the Balancing of the<br>Conflicting Interests? .....  | 303 |
| III. Final Conclusion: Don't Judge a Book by its Cover .....   | 305 |
| IV. Epilogue.....  | 307 |
| <br><i>Bibliography</i> .....  | 310 |
| <i>Index</i> .....   | 321 |