

substantial new material from scholars and serving High Court judges regarding Indigenous peoples and their relationship to the state, constitutional interpretation and federalism. The commentary on Ch III has incorporated the substantial High Court output in this area over the past four years and the material on human rights, federalism, the Territories, economic freedoms and the implied freedom of political communication has been reorganised to maximise coherence and reflect current emphases. With a referendum on constitutional recognition of Indigenous peoples planned for the first term of the Abbott government, the final chapter on constitutional change has been thoroughly revised.

The addition of new material has required the making of hard choices about where to cut back and consolidate. This has often involved pruning older cases in favour of new approaches, but in some areas more substantial cuts have been made. In particular, this edition does not have a chapter on the industrial relations power in s 51(xxxv) of the Constitution. After more than a century of sustained constitutional development, the power is now otiose due to the ascendancy of the corporations power in s 51(xx), which has been applied by the Commonwealth to enact laws such as the *Fair Work Act 2009* (Cth). The current state of the law on the industrial relations power remains as it was set out in the fifth edition of this book.

In writing this edition, we have again benefited greatly from the suggestions and insights of many people. In particular, we would like to thank those who reviewed the last edition, as well as others who sent us ideas for change or supplied us with helpful information. They include Gabrielle Appleby, Shelley Bielefeld, Tony Blackshield, AJ Brown, Dylan Lino, John Pyke, Kim Rubenstein, Greg Taylor, Steven Tudor and Anne Twomey.

We also thank Rafe Andrews and Lyndon Goddard for their superb research assistance, supported by the UNSW Law School. Their intelligence, industry and organisational skills were of indispensable benefit to the production of this edition. As with the last five editions, we owe an enormous debt of gratitude to the team at The Federation Press for their support of and dedication to this project, with particular thanks to Kathy Fitzhenry for her assiduous editing of a very large manuscript.

For their enormous and positive support and for their forbearance, George Williams thanks Emma Armson, Edward and Ellie, Sean Brennan thanks Kate Temby, Lara, Darcy, Margaret Brennan and Peter Brennan and Andrew Lynch thanks Louise Halpin and Eamon. We acknowledge the support of our colleagues and friends in the Gilbert + Tobin Centre of Public Law and particularly Professor Rosalind Dixon, whose willingness to serve as Interim Director of the Centre made it possible for both of the new authors to dedicate the time necessary to complete the book.

As between the three of us, this book has been a fully collaborative effort, and we take joint responsibility for all chapters.

George Williams

Sean Brennan

Andrew Lynch

11 November 2013

## Table of Contents

Preface to the Sixth Edition v

Acknowledgments xv

Table of Extracts xviii

Table of Cases xxiii

Table of Statutes xlii

## Part I Australian Constitutionalism

### Chapter 1 Foundations 2

1. Australia: A Constitutional Hybrid 2
2. Political and Legal Constitutionalism 4
3. Liberalism 7
4. Economic Liberalism 14
5. Rule of Law 16
6. Separation of Powers 25
7. Grundnorm and Coup d'Etat 29
  - (a) The Basic Norm 29
  - (b) Coup d'Etat 32
8. Further References 38

### Chapter 2 Origins and Influences 40

1. Introduction 40
2. The Evolution of the Westminster Constitution 40
  - (a) Magna Carta 40
  - (b) Parliament 45
  - (c) Star Chamber and Common Law Courts 49
  - (d) The Bloodless Revolution 58
3. Westminster Government 60
  - (a) Responsible and Representative Government 60
  - (b) Parliamentary Sovereignty 63
  - (c) Constitutional Conventions 70
  - (d) Courts and Private Law 75
4. The Constitution of the United States 77
  - (a) Separations of Power – Horizontal and Vertical 80
  - (b) Judicial Review 82
5. Further References 88

### Chapter 3 Path to Independence 90

1. Colonisation 90
2. The Colonial Legislatures 98
3. Federation 102
4. The Colonial Legacy 107
5. The Statute of Westminster 110
  - (a) Extraterritoriality 112
  - (b) Repugnancy 113
6. Appeals to the Privy Council 118

7. The Australia Act	121
8. Popular Sovereignty	125
9. Further References	131
<b>Chapter 4 Indigenous Peoples</b>	133
1. Introduction	133
2. Aboriginal Peoples and the Constitution	135
3. Native Title	136
4. Indigenous Sovereignty	146
(a) Perspectives on Sovereignty	146
(b) The United States	148
(c) The Australian Situation	153
5. Self-Determination	161
6. Further References	166

## Part 2

### Constitutional Interpretation

<b>Chapter 5 Constitutional Interpretation</b>	170
1. Literalism, Legalism and Judicial Choice	170
2. The Jumbunna Principle	182
3. The Dead Hand and the Living Tree	186
(a) Use of Historical Materials	186
(b) The Intention of the Framers	188
(c) Textualism	192
(d) Incremental Accommodation	196
(e) Purposive Interpretation	199
(f) Strategic Compromise?	207
4. Coherence, Integrity and Postmodernity	213
5. Legal Culture, Gender and 'Different Voices'	221
6. Further References	228

## Part 3

### The Federal System

<b>Chapter 6 Federalism and the Engineers Case</b>	232
1. Federalism	232
2. Australian Federalism	238
3. The Division of Legislative Power	242
4. Implied Immunity of Instrumentalities	243
5. Reserved State Powers	248
6. The Engineers Case	253
7. Further References	261
<b>Chapter 7 Australian Federalism in Practice</b>	262
1. Intergovernmental Relations	262
2. Co-operative Legislative Schemes	265
3. Referrals of Power	274
4. Powers of the United Kingdom Parliament	277
5. Federal Financial Relations	279

6. Equal Treatment of States	284
7. Further References	296
<b>Chapter 8 Inconsistency between Commonwealth and State Laws</b>	297
1. Meaning of 'Invalid' and 'Prevail'	297
2. The Tests of Inconsistency	298
3. Self-executing Machine?	310
4. Manufacturing Inconsistency	311
5. Manufacturing Consistency	321
6. Further References	331
<b>Chapter 9 The Territories</b>	332
1. The Territories	332
2. Scope of the Territories Power	334
3. Limits on the Territories Power	336
4. Further References	350

## Part 4

### The Executive and Executive Power

<b>Chapter 10 The Executive</b>	352
1. The Crown	352
2. The Governor-General	356
3. Executive Power	365
(a) Prerogative Power	366
(b) Nationhood Power	379
(c) Power Conferred by Statute	397
(d) Contracting and Spending	406
4. Control of the Executive	414
(a) Responsible Government	414
(b) Constitutional Writs	420
5. Further References	427

## Part 5

### The Judiciary and Judicial Power

<b>Chapter 11 The High Court</b>	430
1. The Platonic High Court	430
2. Appointment and Removal of Judges	432
(a) Appointment	432
(b) Removal	434
3. Jurisdiction	437
(a) Appellate Jurisdiction	437
(b) Original Jurisdiction	439
(c) 'Matters'	441
(d) Standing	455
(e) Justiciability	464
4. Remedies	470
(a) Invalidity	470
(b) Reading Down and Severance	473

5. Deciding Constitutional Cases	476
(a) Judicial Parsimony	476
(b) Precedent and Overruling	480
6. Further References	489
<b>Chapter 12 Separation of Judicial Power</b>	490
1. The Separation of Federal Judicial Power	490
2. The Separation of State Judicial Power	500
3. Defining Judicial Power	502
4. Judicial Power and Administrative Tribunals	509
5. Exceptions to the Boilermakers Case	517
(a) Military Tribunals	518
(b) Delegation of Judicial Power	521
(c) Persona Designata Rule	523
6. The Incompatibility Doctrine	531
7. Legislative Usurpation and Interference	535
8. Further References	539
<b>Chapter 13 Judicial and Non-Judicial Detention</b>	541
1. Introduction	541
2. The Incompatibility Doctrine	543
3. Protective Detention	554
4. Immigration Detention	557
5. Preventive Detention	574
6. Control Orders	589
7. Further References	602
<b>Chapter 14 The Judicial Process</b>	603
1. Introduction	603
2. Retrospectivity	607
3. Fair Trial	616
4. Equal Justice	619
5. Impartiality, Independence and Integrity	627
(a) Judges – Appointment and Conditions	627
(b) Secrecy and Non-Disclosure	632
(c) Decisional Independence	642
(d) Supervisory Jurisdiction	649
6. Further References	652

## Part 6

### The Parliament and Legislative Power

#### Chapter 15 Federal Parliament

1. Introduction	654
2. Parliamentary Privilege	654
3. Voting and Elections	656
(a) Voting	656
(b) Express Right to Vote	660
(c) Implied Right to Vote	664
(d) Voter Equality	677
(e) A Level Playing Field?	688
(f) Territory Senators	693

4. Eligibility for Election	698
5. Resolving Deadlocks	706
6. Further References	720
<b>Chapter 16 State Legislative Power</b>	722
1. Introduction	722
2. State Legislative Power	724
(a) Peace, Welfare and Good Government	724
(b) Constitutional Amendment	732
3. Manner and Form Requirements	737
4. Alternative Procedures	748
5. The Ranasinghe Principle	753
6. Further References	759
<b>Chapter 17 Characterisation</b>	760
1. Characterisation	760
2. Dual Characterisation	764
3. Interaction between Heads of Power	773
4. Subject Matter and Purpose Powers	778
5. Subject Matter Powers	779
(a) Sufficient Connection	779
(b) The Role of Purpose	785
(c) Incidental Powers	786
6. Proportionality – Purpose Powers and Limitations	788
(a) Purpose Powers	788
(b) Beyond Purpose Powers?	790
(c) Constitutional Limitations	799
7. Further References	801
<b>Chapter 18 Economic Powers</b>	802
1. The Trade and Commerce Power	802
(a) Scope	802
(b) Incidental Aspect	806
2. The Corporations Power	815
(a) Huddart Parker Overthrown	815
(b) Which Corporations?	818
(c) Reach of the Power	828
3. Further References	844
<b>Chapter 19 Defence Power</b>	845
1. Nature of the Power	845
2. War	847
3. Post-War	854
4. Peace	856
5. Military Justice	857
6. Cold War: The Communist Party Case	863
7. Terrorism and National Security	876
8. Further References	884
<b>Chapter 20 International Law and the External Affairs Power</b>	885
1. Reception of International Law	885
2. International Law and Constitutional Interpretation	891

3. External Affairs	896
(a) Relations with Other Countries	896
(b) Matters External to Australia	898
(c) International Law Other than Treaties	902
4. Implementing Treaties	903
(a) Entering into Treaties	903
(b) First Approaches	904
(c) The Expanding Power	908
(d) The Power Confirmed	919
(e) International Recommendations	926
5. Further References	929
<b>Chapter 21 Immigration and Aliens Powers</b>	930
1. The White Australia Policy	930
2. 'Once an immigrant always an immigrant'	932
3. Naturalisation and Aliens	945
(a) Citizenship	945
(b) Persons Born in Britain	954
(c) Persons Born in Australia	972
4. Further References	985
<b>Chapter 22 Races Power</b>	986
1. Introduction	986
2. A Commonwealth Power in Relation to Aboriginal People	987
3. Special Laws Deemed Necessary for People of Any Race	989
4. For the Benefit of a Race?	997
5. Further References	1008
<b>Chapter 23 Taxation and Excise</b>	1010
1. The Taxation Power	1010
(a) What is a Tax?	1011
(b) Fees for Services	1018
(c) Arbitrary Exactions	1023
(d) Incidental Aspect	1025
2. Excise Duties	1027
(a) First Approaches	1028
(b) Widening Views of Excise	1030
(c) The Tangled Web of Dennis Hotels	1032
(d) Alcohol, Tobacco and Petrol	1035
(e) The Grip of Precedent	1042
(f) The States Lose \$5 Billion	1045
3. Further References	1050
<b>Chapter 24 Appropriations and Grants</b>	1051
1. The Appropriation Power	1051
(a) 'Purposes of the Commonwealth'	1051
(b) The AAP Case	1054
(c) Section 81 Resolved	1061
(d) Controls on Government Expenditure	1065
2. The Grants Power	1067
(a) The Early Cases	1067

(b) The Uniform Tax Cases	1069
(c) Limits on the Power	1077
3. Further References	1080
<b>Part 7</b>	
<b>Limits on Power</b>	
<b>Chapter 25 Intergovernmental Immunities</b>	1082
1. Intergovernmental Immunities	1082
2. Commonwealth Laws and the States	1084
(a) The Melbourne Corporation Principle	1084
(b) Restatement I: Two Principles	1091
(c) Restatement II: One Principle	1101
3. State Laws and the Commonwealth	1113
4. Further References	1130
<b>Chapter 26 Human Rights</b>	1131
1. Human Rights	1131
2. Bills of Rights	1136
3. The Common Law and the Principle of Legality	1149
4. Trial by Jury	1156
5. Freedom of Religion	1167
(a) Separation of Church and State	1167
(b) Section 116	1173
6. Rights of Out-of-State Residents	1183
7. Further References	1193
<b>Chapter 27 Economic Freedoms</b>	1195
1. Freedom of Interstate Trade, Commerce and Intercourse	1195
(a) Isaacs, Dixon and Barwick	1195
(b) The Whitfield Thunderbolt	1206
(c) Cole's New World	1214
(d) 'Intercourse' among the States	1226
2. Acquisition of Property on Just Terms	1230
(a) Property	1231
(b) Laws with Respect to the Acquisition of Property	1232
(c) Just Terms	1252
3. Further References	1257
<b>Chapter 28 Freedom of Political Communication</b>	1259
1. Introduction	1259
2. The Murphy Catalyst	1259
3. Launch of the Implied Freedom	1261
4. Expansion and Division	1273
5. The Implied Freedom Confirmed	1284
6. Further References	1291
<b>Chapter 29 Freedom of Political Communication: Testing Boundaries</b>	1292
1. Expressive Conduct	1292
2. Movement and Association	1295
3. The Politics of Protest	1300
4. Electoral Matters	1311

5. The Judicial Process	1316
(a) Criticising Judges	1316
(b) Limitations from Ch III	1322
6. Lange's Two Questions	1327
(a) Burdens on Political Communication	1328
(b) Legitimate Ends and Proportionate Means	1328
7. Further References	1336

## Part 8

### Constitutional Change

#### Chapter 30 Constitutional Change

1. Amending the Constitution	1338
2. The Referendum Record	1339
3. An Australian Republic?	1343
4. Aboriginal Peoples	1352
5. Further References	1359

## Part 9 Appendix

### Appendix

1. Australian Constitution	1362
2. Colonial Laws Validity Act 1865 (Imp)	1379
3. Statute of Westminster Adoption Act 1942 (Cth)	1380
4. Australia Act 1986 (Cth)	1382
5. Justices of the High Court of Australia	1386
(a) The Justices	1386
(b) Composition of the Court	1387

### Index

1390

## Acknowledgments

The authors and publisher thank these organisations for permission to reproduce the following material:

- ACT Government for extracts from: Report of the ACT Bill of Rights Consultative Committee, *Towards an ACT Human Rights Act* (May 2003).
- Academy of the Social Sciences in Australia for extracts from: *Dialogue*.
- Adelaide Law Review for extracts from: the *Adelaide Law Review*.
- ANU E Press for extracts from Janet Hunt, Diane Smith, Stephanie Garland and Will Sanders (eds), *Contested Governance: Culture, Power and Institutions in Indigenous Australia* (2008).
- Auckland University Press for extracts from: FM Brookfield, *Waitangi & Indigenous Rights: Revolution, Law and Legitimation* (1999).
- Blackwell for extracts from: the *Australian Journal of Politics & History*.
- Boston College Law Review for extracts from: the *Boston College Law Review*.
- Cambridge University Press for extracts from: J Locke, *Two Treatises of Government* (1690; critical ed by P Laslett; 2nd ed, 1967); GR Elton, *The Tudor Constitution* (1962); G Huscroft and B Miller (eds), *The Challenge of Originalism: Theories of Constitutional Interpretation* (2011); Gabrielle Appleby, Nicholas Aroney and Thomas John (eds), *The Future of Australian Federalism* (2012).
- Canada Government Publishing Centre for extracts from: *The Supreme Court Reports*.
- Cardozo Law Review for extracts from: *Cardozo Law Review*.
- CCH Limited Australia for extracts from: *The Australian Torts Reports*.
- Central Queensland University Press for extracts from I Callinan, *The Lawyer and the Libertine* (1997).
- Centre for Continuing Education, ANU, for extracts from: AR Blackshield, 'The Law' in *Power in Australia: Directions of Change* (1981).
- Centre for Independent Studies for extracts from: C Kukathas (ed), *Multicultural Citizens: The Philosophy and Politics of Identity* (1993).
- Centre for Research on Federal Financial Relations, ANU, for extracts from: RL Mathews, *Revenue Sharing in Federal Systems* (Research Monograph No 31, 1980).
- Columbia University Press for extracts from: L Henkin, *The Age of Rights* (1990); J Rawls, *Political Liberalism* (1993).
- Commonwealth of Australia for extracts from: BC Wright (ed), *House of Representatives Practice* (Department of the House of Representatives, 6th ed, 2012); P Keating, *An Australian Republic: The Way Forward* (7 June 1995); JA Pettifer (ed), *House of Representatives Practice* (1st ed, 1981); Republic Advisory Committee, *An Australian Republic: The Options* (1993); G Sawyer, *The Australian Constitution* (2nd ed, 1988); Council for Aboriginal Reconciliation, *Reconciliation: Australia's Challenge* (2000); Commonwealth Grants Commission, *Report on GST Revenue Sharing Relativities: 2013 Update* (2013); *Recognising Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Peoples in the Constitution* (Report of the Expert Panel, January 2012); The Australian Citizenship Test Review Committee, *Moving Forward ... Improving Pathways to Citizenship* (2008).
- Council of Law Reporting for England and Wales for extracts from: *Appeal Cases*.
- Council for Law Reporting for New South Wales for extracts from: *The New South Wales Law Reports*.
- Department of Treasury and Finance, WA, for extracts from: *Discussion Paper on Commonwealth-State Financial Relations: An Economic and Financial Assessment of How Western Australia Fares* (2006).
- Dorset Press for extracts from: G Smith, *A Constitutional and Legal History of England* (1990).
- Duncker & Humblot for extracts from: W Krawietz et al (eds), *Theorie der Normen: Festgabe für Ota Weinberger zum 65. Geburtstag* (1984).
- Federal Law Review for extracts from: the *Federal Law Review*.