

Contents

Preface vii
Acknowledgements ix

1. Remorse and its Relevance to Penal Theory 1
 Overview of the Book..... 2
 Part I: Retributive Arguments 3
 Part II: Remorse and Sentencing Practice 4
 Setting the Scene: Remorse 5
 Gaita’s Account of Remorse..... 6
 Distinguishing Shame from Remorse 8
 Distinguishing Guilt from Remorse..... 9
 Distinguishing Regret from Remorse 10
 Clarifying Remorse 10
 Setting the Scene: Penal Theory 12
 Classical Retributivism..... 13
 Modern Retributivism..... 15
 Benefits and Burdens Retributivism..... 16
 The Penance Perspective on Retributivism..... 16
 Censure and Sanction Retributivism..... 17
 Contribution of the Book 17

Part I Retributive Arguments

2. The Changed Person Argument..... 21
 Parallels with the Time Delay Argument 22
 The Strong Thesis: Change and Personal Identity..... 23
 Discontinuity of Identity 25
 Remorse Presupposes an Enduring Self..... 28
 The Weak Thesis: Change and Blameworthiness 30
 Blameworthiness as the Attribution of Responsibility
 to the Offender..... 31
 Blameworthiness as the Moral Assessment of the Offender 38
 Conclusion..... 39
3. The Reduced Harm Argument 41
 Criminal Harm and Wrongdoing..... 42
 The Living Standard Analysis of Harm 44
 How Might Remorse Repair a Victim’s
 Living Standard? 45

The Living Standard Time Frame.....	46
Distinguishing Between Time Frames.....	48
Challenging the Set Harm View	49
Harm Reduction and Risked Harms.....	54
Humiliation on the Living Standard Account	55
The Harm of Wrongdoing.....	57
Summary and Conclusion.....	60
4. The Already Punished Argument.....	62
Natural Punishment.....	62
Punishment Proper	64
Subjective Versus Objective Metrics of Punishment	65
Theory One: Benefits and Burdens	68
The Benefit of Satisfaction	69
Remorse as Dissatisfaction.....	70
The Benefit of Freedom.....	72
Remorse Re-imposes Self-restraint	73
Theory Two: Duff and the Penance Perspective.....	75
State Punishment and Self-punishment.....	76
Eliciting Repentance	78
Expressing Repentance	79
Self-punishment can Constitute Some of the Deserved Punishment	81
Duff's Vacillation	83
Theory Three: von Hirsch and Ashworth—Censure and Sanction	84
Remorse as a Substitute for Sanction	84
Remorse as a Deterrent	85
Remorse as Delivering Censure.....	87
Remorse as Reattachment to Normative Reasons to Refrain	88
Conclusion.....	88
5. The Responsive Censure Argument	90
Overview	90
Blameworthiness and Blame	91
Affecting the Severity of the Blame Deserved.....	94
The Centrality of Censure to Communicative Retributive Theories.....	95
The Case for Responsive Censure.....	98
The Core Argument	100
Support from Communicative Retributive Theories: Rational Agency	101
Some Preliminary Concerns	102

Remorse is the Offender’s Ideal, Relevant Contribution to the Dialogue.....	103
Quasi-retributive Grounds and von Hirsch and Ashworth’s Time Delay Argument	104
Mitigation of Punishment is Necessitated by Responsive Censure	107
An Argument Against the Plausibility of Thinking of Punishment in Dialogical Terms.....	108
Conditions for Dialogue.....	109
The Problem of Offender Unwillingness	110
The Problem of the Performative Nature of Condemnation.....	111
Remorse and the ‘Generic-script’ Problem	114
Current Practice is Insensitive to Offenders’ Attitudes	115
Summary	116
Conclusion.....	117
6. The Merciful Compassion Argument	119
Responsive Censure and the Exercise of Mercy	120
The Role of Mercy.....	122
A Closer Look at the Internal–External Distinction.....	123
Mercy and its Relationship to Retributive Justice	125
What Makes a Value Internal to a Conception of Justice?	125
What Makes Mercy Internal to Penal Justice?	126
Contrasting Mercy with Leniency	127
Does Tasioulas Succeed in Positioning Mercy Internally?	128
Problems with Tasioulas’s Account	129
The Unique Nature of Remorse	130
Summary.....	131
Further Reasons to Prefer My Account	132
Why We Need a Principle Rather than Merciful Discretion	133
Could Mercy Constitute a Principle?.....	133
Conclusion.....	134
Part II Remorse and Sentencing Practice	
7. From Murder to Marijuana: A Nuanced Approach to Remorse-based Mitigation	139
The Relevance of Offence Type	141
The Sentencing Council’s Consultation on Sexual Offences	142
Offence Type and Responsive Censure.....	145
Offence Type and Merciful Compassion	146

Consequentialist Aims.....	147
The Relevance of Offence Seriousness	147
Offence Type, Seriousness and the Morally	
Sufficient Response	149
<i>Mala Prohibita</i> Offences and Civic Duty	150
‘Victimless’ Offences	155
Offences Causing Lesser Harm	156
Quantum of Mitigation	157
Current Levels of Guidance and Adding Nuance.....	159
Conclusion.....	160
8. The Remorseful Recidivist	161
The Mitigating Effect of Remorse	163
The Penal Relevance of Previous Convictions	165
Progressive Loss of Mitigation and the	
Lapse Theory	165
Remorse and Previous Convictions on	
the Lapse Theory.....	167
The Enhanced Culpability Model.....	169
The State of Mind of the Repeat Offender	170
Foresight and Culpability.....	171
Remorse and Previous Convictions on the	
Strong Culpability Model.....	173
Remorse and Previous Convictions on the	
Weak Culpability Model	175
Remorse, Previous Convictions and	
Attuned Censure	176
Summary of Consequences for Sentencing.....	176
Remorse and Recidivism in Practice.....	177
Implications for Sentencing Guidelines.....	178
9. Remorse in the Sentencing Guidelines.....	180
England and Wales.....	181
Remorse in the Sentencing Guidelines of	
England and Wales	182
Generic Guidelines: Offence Seriousness and	
Sentence Reductions for a Guilty Plea	182
Guidelines Limiting the Influence of Remorse	183
Guidelines Supporting a More Extensive	
Mitigating Role for Remorse.....	185
The Sentencing Council Guidelines.....	187
Remorse in Sentencing Practice in	
England and Wales	188
Remorse in Other Jurisdictions	190

The Victorian Sentencing Manual.....	190
The Nature of Remorse	192
Standard of Proof for Remorse	194
Stage at Which Remorse is Shown	194
Serious Violent Offences	195
New Zealand Sentencing Act.....	195
United States Sentencing Manual.....	197
Acceptance of Responsibility.....	199
Conclusion	202
10. Implications for Penal Theory and Sentencing.....	203
<i>Index</i>	207

<http://www.pbookshop.com>