## Contents

| Prefac | ce          |   | V           |
|--------|-------------|---|-------------|
| Intro  | ducti       | ion. The Right to Housing: Law, Concepts, Possibilities   | 1           |
| I      | Ass         | sumptions, Definitions, Scope   | 3           |
|        | A. B. C. D. | Law, Concepts, Possibilities or Concepts, Law, Possibilities?: a Note on the Structural Tensions Defining Housing, House and Home A 'Right to Housing' versus 'Housing Rights' Categorising the Right to Housing: Economic, Social or Cultural Right? | 3<br>4<br>5 |
| PART   | L           | AW  |             |
| Introd | ducti       | AW ion  | 13          |
| 1 Th   | e Riş       | ght to Housing in the International Eul of Rights   | 15          |
| I      | Int         | roduction   | 15          |
| II     | Un          | iversal Declaration of Human Rights   | 15          |
| III    | Inte        | ernational Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights   | 17          |
|        | Α.          | General Comments 4 and 7 and the Elements of the Right to   |             |
|        |             | Housing \\\   | 20          |
|        |             | (i) Legal Security of Tenure  | 21          |
|        |             | (ii) Availability of Services, Materials, Facilities and  | 21          |
|        |             | Infirstructure  | 23          |
|        |             | (iii) Affordability   | 24          |
|        |             | (iv) Habitability   | 25          |
|        |             | (v) Accessibility   | 26          |
|        |             | (vi) Location   | 27          |
|        |             | (vii) Cultural Adequacy   | 28          |
|        | В.          | Optional Protocol: New Opportunities for Enforcement and  |             |
|        |             | Interpretation  | 29          |
|        | C.          | Conclusions on the Interpretation of the Right to Housing under the ICESCR  | 31          |
| IV     | Inte        | ernational Covenant on Civil and Political Rights   | 32          |
|        | Α.          | Discrimination, Unlawful Interference and Inhuman Treatment   |             |
|        |             | in Housing  | 33          |
|        | В.          | Socio-economic Conditions and the Enjoyment of ICCPR Rights   | 35          |

| 2 | The     | e Right to Housing in Subject-Specific International Conventions          | 38 |
|---|---------|---|----|
|   | I<br>II | Introduction Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination | 38 |
|   | 11      | Against Women   | 39 |
|   | III     |   | 41 |
|   |         | Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial                      |    |
|   |         | Discrimination  | 43 |
|   | V       | Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman and                   | 10 |
|   | -       | Degrading Treatment or Punishment   | 46 |
|   | VI      | Conclusion  | 48 |
|   |         |   |    |
| 3 | The     | e Right to Housing in Regional Covenants                                  | 49 |
|   | I       | Introduction  | 49 |
|   | II      | The Right to Housing in Europe  | 49 |
|   |         | A. Revised European Social Charter  | 50 |
|   |         |   |    |
|   |         | (i) The Scheme of Rights Protection under the RESC                        | 50 |
|   |         | (ii) State Housing Policy and Vulnerability                               | 54 |
|   |         | (iii) Housing Restitution   | 57 |
|   |         | (iv) Roma Rights  | 60 |
|   |         | B. European Convention on Human Rights                                    | 67 |
|   |         | (i) The Scheme of Rights Protection under the ECHR                        | 67 |
|   |         | (ii) Article 8: Home, Family, Private Life and the Right to               |    |
|   |         | Housing   | 68 |
|   |         | (iii) Protocol 1 Article 1 and the Right to Protection of Property        | 71 |
|   |         | (iv) Right to Life under Article 2 and Positive Obligations for           |    |
|   |         | a Right to Housing  | 72 |
|   |         | (v) Destruction of Housing, Destitution and Inhuman                       |    |
|   |         | Treatment under Article 3   | 73 |
|   |         | (vi) Conclusions on the Right to Housing under the ECHR                   | 74 |
|   | III     | African Regional Housing Rights   | 75 |
|   |         | A. The Scheme of Rights Protection in Africa                              | 75 |
|   |         | B. Implied Right to Housing and Shelter in the African Charter            | 76 |
|   |         | C. Conclusion   | 82 |
|   | IV      | Inter-American Human Rights System  | 83 |
|   |         | A. The Inter-American Scheme of Human Rights Protection                   | 83 |
|   |         | B. Implying a Right to Housing in the Americas: Three Methods             | 85 |
|   |         | (i) Forced Evictions, Expulsions and the Destruction of                   |    |
|   |         | Housing   | 85 |
|   |         | (ii) Housing and the Dignified Life                                       | 87 |
|   |         | (iii) Remedies and Reparations, including Material Goods                  | 89 |
|   | V       | Arab Charter on Human Pights  | 01 |

|    | VI   | Conclusions on the Regional Protection of the Right to Housing   | 92  |
|----|------|--|-----|
| 4  | Th   | e Right to Housing as a Constitutional Right: South African and  |     |
| In | diar | n Experiences  | 94  |
|    | I    | Introduction   | 94  |
|    | II   | A Justiciable Right to Housing: the South African Approach   | 94  |
|    |      | A. Crafting a South African Approach to the Right to Housing: the <i>Grootboom</i> Case  | 97  |
|    |      | B. Reasonableness and its Discontents  | 99  |
|    |      | <ul><li>C. <i>Joe Slovo</i>: Recovering the Social, the Political and the Historical?</li><li>D. Conclusions on the South African Approach to the Right to</li></ul> | 103 |
|    |      | Housing  | 108 |
|    | III  | The Right to Housing as a Right to Life: the Indian Approach   | 108 |
|    |      | A. Introduction  | 108 |
|    |      | B. The Right to Housing as a Right to Life and Livelihood  | 110 |
|    |      | C. Conclusions on the Indian Experience  | 118 |
| 5  | The  | e De-radicalised Right to Housing: An Assessment of Interpretive   |     |
| 9  |      | lings  | 120 |
|    | Ι    | Introduction   | 120 |
|    | II   | Gaps and Weaknesses in the Legal Interpretation of the Right to  |     |
|    |      | Housing  | 121 |
|    |      | A. The Issue of Definition   | 122 |
|    |      | B. The Problem of Proceduralisation  | 129 |
|    |      | (i) Procedural Interpretation of the Right to Housing  | 129 |
|    |      | (ii) Programmatic Approach to the Right to Housing   | 131 |
|    |      | C. The Failure of the Legal Right to Housing in the Context of   |     |
|    |      | Human Rights Violation   | 134 |
|    | III  | Conclusion   | 137 |
| PA | ART  | II CONCEPTS  |     |
| In | troc | luction  | 141 |
| 6  | Priv | vacy   | 145 |
|    | I    | Introduction   | 145 |
|    | II   | Public/Private and the Operation of Law in the Creation of   |     |
|    |      | Homelessness   | 146 |
|    | III  | Visible Homelessness of Street and Pavement Dwellers and   |     |
|    | 13.7 | Deprivation of the Private   | 148 |
|    |      | Women's Essential Homelessness and Enforced Privacy  | 152 |
|    | V    | Erasing the Public/Private Distinction and the Hidden<br>Homelessness of Domestic Workers  | 159 |
|    |      | 1 TOTHER COSTICOS OF DOTHER WOLKERS  | 132 |

## x Contents

|     | VI      | Conclusion: Homelessness, Rightlessness and the Right to<br>Housing as Social Belonging   | 165                               |
|-----|---------|---|-----------------------------------|
|     |         |   |                                   |
| 7   |         | ntity   | 169                               |
|     | I<br>II | Introduction  Promoting Identity: Constituting Personhood and Community   | 169                               |
|     | 11      | Promoting Identity: Constituting Personhood and Community through Housing   | 173                               |
|     |         | A. Housing and Personhood   | 173                               |
|     |         | B. Housing and the Constitution of Community  | 178                               |
|     | III     | Constraining and Erasing Identities: Housing as Social Control  | 183                               |
|     |         | A. Constraining Identities: Women, Family and the Ideal of Home B. Erasure of Indigenous Identity: Forced Displacement and  | 184                               |
|     |         | Acculturation through Housing Policy  | 189                               |
|     | IV      | Conclusion  | 196                               |
| 8   | Spa     | ce  | 198                               |
|     | I       | Introduction: the Spatiality of Rights  | 198                               |
|     | II      | Housing as Social Control/Housing as Social Transformation  | 200                               |
|     | III     | Mumbai: Housing, Rights, Citizenship, Space   | 201                               |
|     | IV      | Vision Mumbai and the Planning of Social Transformation   | 206                               |
|     |         | <ul><li>A. Inclusion or Invisibility; City Beautification and Rights to Space</li><li>B. Territory, Rights and Control: Governing the Space of the City</li></ul> | <ul><li>209</li><li>217</li></ul> |
|     | V       | Conclusion: the Boundaries of Spatial Analysis and the Possibilities of the Right to Housing  | 223                               |
| PΑ  | ART     | III POSSIBILITIES   |                                   |
| 1 1 | 11(1    | III TOSSIDITTIES  |                                   |
| 9   | Pos     | sibilities, Politics, Law   | 231                               |
|     | I       | The Right to Housing: Illustrating Ambivalence in Human Rights  |                                   |
|     | TT      | for Social Transformation   | 231                               |
|     | II      | Institutional Mythologies and the Hidden Politics of Human Rights   | 233                               |
|     |         | A. Institutional Mythologies  | 234                               |
|     | ***     | B. The Hidden Politics of Human Rights  | 237                               |
|     | III     | The Ownership of Rights   | 239                               |
|     |         | A. The Critique of Rights as Cooptation and False Promise   | 240                               |
|     |         | <ul><li>B. Agency and the Ownership of Human Rights</li><li>C. Law, Politics and Possibilities: the Role of Legal Subjectivity</li></ul>                          | <ul><li>241</li><li>246</li></ul> |
|     | 13.7    |   | ∠ <del>1</del> 0                  |
|     | IV      | Conclusion: Human Rights Utopia and Fundamental Human Equality  | 249                               |
| Bı  | iblio   | graphy  | 251                               |
|     | ıdex    | 017   | 269                               |