

range of possibilities open to them and to provide some practical tips. We hope that, although not providing all the answers, it will provide a useful guide through the numerous remedies available for dealing with probate disputes.

We have based our exposition of the law on our understanding of the materials available to us at 1 April 1997.

Brendan Hall
Wedlake Saint

Dawn Goodman
Withers

CONTENTS

Dedication – Brendan Hall deceased	v
Preface	vii
Preface to the First Edition	ix
Table of Cases	xxiii
Table of Statutes	xxxvii
Table of Statutory Instruments	xli
Part I	
Pre-Death Issues	
Chapter 1	
Disputes Arising out of Lifetime Transactions	3
Validity of lifetime gifts	3
Capacity to make a gift	3
Practical considerations	5
Gifts made by an attorney or deputy	5
Other lifetime transactions	6
Undue influence	6
Presumed undue influence	6
Relationship between the parties	7
Nature of the transaction	7
Other factors	8
Rebutting the presumption	8
Actual undue influence	9
Other arguments for/against gifts	9
Deathbed gifts	9
The rule in <i>Strong v Bird</i>	11
Presumption against double portions	11
Joint ownership and resulting trusts	12
Presumption of advancement	13
Real property held in joint names	14
Joint bank accounts	14
Undue influence	16
Role of personal representatives	16
Chapter 2	
Court of Protection	17
Statutory wills	17
Failure to execute and seal	17

Challenge to the statutory will	18
Death interrupting proceedings	18
Accounts	19
Authority to authorise gifts	19
Ademption	20
Part II	
Death and Burial Disputes	
Chapter 3	
Coroners' Investigations	23
Background	23
A reported death	24
The inquest	26
Further information	28
Chapter 4	
Disputes – Burial and Ashes	29
No property in a corpse	29
Method of disposal	29
The Deceased's wishes	29
Duty of disposal	30
Hierarchy of those with a duty to dispose of the body	30
Points to note and exceptions to the hierarchy	31
Parental responsibility	31
Householders and those lawfully in possession of the body	32
Local authority	32
Coroner's inquiry	32
Donation of body parts	32
Senior Courts Act 1981, s 116	32
Conflicts between those equally entitled	34
Funeral expenses	35
Headstones	36
Exhumation	37
Practice and procedure	38
Part III	
Obtaining the Grant – Disputes and Resolutions	
Chapter 5	
Obtaining the Will	43
Securing the will	43
Witness summons	43
Last will or codicil	43
Previous documents	44
Proceedings already issued	44
Professional executors and advisers	44
Examination by the court	45

Chapter 6	
Entitlement to the Grant and Applications to Remove Personal Representatives	47
Who may apply?	47
Actions against those claiming entitlement	47
Citations	48
Applications under SCA 1981, s 116 to remove personal representatives	50
Introduction	50
Main uses	50
Procedure	51
Applications under Administration of Justice Act 1985 (AJA 1985), s 50 to remove personal representatives	51
Introduction	51
Procedure	52
Intermeddling	52
What constitutes intermeddling?	53
Extent of liability	53
Chapter 7	
Blocking the Grant: Caveats	55
Entering a caveat	55
Expiry and renewal	55
Warning and appearance	56
Withdrawing the caveat	56
Standing search	56
When to lodge a caveat	57
Doubt about validity of a testamentary document	57
Dispute about who should be personal representative	57
Where a citation is to be taken out	57
When a caveat should not be lodged	58
Chapter 8	
Limited and Discretionary Grants	59
Introduction	59
Administration pending determination of a probate claim	59
Administration ad colligenda bona	60
Grant to part of the estate	61
Chapter 9	
The Foreign Element	63
Introduction	63
English deceased: foreign assets	64
English wills and foreign wills	64
English executors and foreign assets	64
A formally valid will in a foreign jurisdiction	65
Other problems with foreign estates	68
Situs	68

Identifying the assets and ownership structure	68
Tax	69
Foreign deceased: English assets	71
A valid will that can be proved in England	71
Who can take out the grant?	71
Material validity of the will	72
Matrimonial property	73
Practice and procedure	73
Part IV	
Problems with the Will	
Chapter 10	
Rectification	79
What the court is required to ask	79
Clerical error	80
Failure to understand instructions	81
Burden of proof	82
The dividing line with negligence	82
Costs and independent legal advice	84
Procedure	84
Uncontested	84
Contested	85
Compromise and inheritance tax	86
Time-limits and protection for personal representatives	86
Personal representatives' duties and disclosure of will-drafting files	87
Signing the wrong document	88
HM Revenue & Customs	88
Chapter 11	
Construction	89
Background	89
Principles	89
Presumption against intestacy	90
Gifts to family	90
Presumption that a will is rational and not capricious	90
General rules as to evidence	90
Practice and Procedure	91
Resolving non-contentious construction issues	91
Resolving contentious construction issues	92
Costs	93
Chapter 12	
Validity Disputes	95
Validity: essential elements	95
Due execution	95
Basic principles	95
Signature	95
Witnesses and attestation	96

Presumption of due execution	97
Revocation	98
Burden of proof and presumptions	99
Testamentary capacity	100
Presumption of capacity	101
Proof of actual understanding or inference of capacity	102
Capacity at execution	103
The effect of drugs or alcohol	103
The effect of bereavement	103
Knowledge and approval	104
Reviewing the evidence	105
Solicitors benefiting under a will	106
Undue influence	107
Standard of proof in undue influence	108
Fraud	109
Fraudulent calumny	109
Forgery	110
Practice and procedure	110
Pre-claim investigations	110
Standing search	110
Caveat	111
Collating evidence	111
Further investigations	116
Joint or sole approach	116
Proceedings	117
Jurisdiction	117
Limitation	117
Pre-action	117
Commencement and procedure	118
Evidence about testamentary documents	118
Parties or persons who may be affected	119
Service of the claim form	119
Defence and counterclaim	119
Revocation of existing grant	119
Judgment in default	119
Discontinuance	119
Compromise	120
Mediation or conciliation	120
Settlement before trial	120
Costs	121
Chapter 13	
Claims against Personal Representatives	125
Introduction	125
Accounts, inquiries and inventories	125
Application under the Non-Contentious Probate Rules 1987 (NCPR 1987)	126
Application to the Public Trustee	127

Application for accounts and inquiries or inventories	127
Disclosure and inspection of trust documents	129
The general position	129
Devastavit, breach of trust and fiduciary duty	131
Devastavit	132
Examples of devastavit	132
Breach of trust	134
Common breaches of trust	135
Breach of fiduciary duty	138
Action for devastavit, breach of trust or breach of fiduciary duty	139
Extent of liability	140
Defences to claims	141
On the merits	141
Section 27 of the Trustee Act 1925	142
Section 26 of the Trustee Act 1925	142
Court order	142
Section 61 of the Trustee Act 1925	143
Limitation	143
Doctrine of laches	145
Acquiescence or release by beneficiaries	145
Exclusion, exoneration or exemption clauses	146
Procedure	147
Pre-action procedure	147
Statements of case	147
Case management system	148
Detailed budgets	150
Disclosure	150
Evidence	152
Preparation for trial	153
Interim applications	154
Summary judgment	154
Security for costs	155
Pre-emptive costs orders	155
Injunctions	156
Specific disclosure and further information	157
Striking out	157
Removal and substitution	158
Application for removal or substitution of personal representatives	158
Action for removal of will trustees	159
Removal under s 41 of the Trustee Act 1925 or court's inherent power	159
Judicial trustees	160
Application for directions	161
Parties	162
Procedure	164
Costs implications	165
Costs	166
Costs capping	168

<i>Beddoe</i> orders: obtaining permission of the court to issue or defend proceedings	169
Action against a third party	169
Action against a beneficiary	171
Whole estate under attack	171
Action by a beneficiary	172
Procedure	172
<i>Benjamin</i> order	173
Procedure	174
Indemnities	174
Chapter 14	
Disappointed Beneficiary Claims: Proprietary Estoppel and Constructive Trust Claims	177
Introduction	177
Why bring a claim?	177
Comparison	177
Principles of proprietary estoppel claims	178
Assurance made to the claimant relating to an interest in specified land	178
The claimant must reasonably rely on the assurance	179
The claimant must suffer detriment in consequence of that reliance	180
It must be unconscionable for the representor to go back on the assurance	181
Remedy	181
Principles of constructive trust claims	182
There must be evidence of agreement in a constructive trust claim	182
The burden is on the claimant to show that the beneficial ownership differs from the legal ownership	182
Remedy for a constructive trust claim	183
Procedure	183
Generally	183
Evidence	183
Compromise	184
Inheritance tax consequences	184
Chapter 15	
Mutual Wills	185
Introduction	185
Definition of a mutual will	185
Effect of a mutual will	186
Evidential standard	186
Practice	187
Difficulties arising between the death of the testators	187
Drafting	188

Chapter 16	
Disappointed Beneficiary Claims: Claims under the Inheritance (Provision for Family and Dependents) Act 1975	189
Does the 1975 Act apply?	189
Domicile	189
Intention to abandon domicile of origin	190
Difficulties with the domicile as the basis of jurisdiction	190
Time-limit to bring a claim	191
Who can apply?	193
Spouse or civil partner of the deceased	193
Former spouse or former civil partner of the deceased	194
Any person living with the deceased as husband, wife or civil partner for 2 years immediately before the death	195
Child of the deceased	196
Treated by the deceased as a child of the family	196
Any person who immediately before the death of the deceased was being maintained by the deceased	196
The court's approach	197
Reasonable financial provision	198
Application by spouse or civil partner of the deceased	198
Other categories of applicant	198
Matters to which the court is to have regard in ascertaining reasonable provision	198
Additional factors	199
Orders that can be made by the court	200
Interim orders	200
Property available for financial provision	200
Sections 8 to 11 of the 1975 Act	201
Issues arising in relation to ss 10 and 11	202
State benefits	203
Application	204
Claims by spouses and civil partners	204
The divorce hypothesis	204
Impact of ancillary relief cases on 1975 Act claims	204
Claims by other categories of applicant	208
Claims by former spouses	209
Claims by cohabitants	209
Claim by a child or someone treated as a child of the family	210
Estrangement	212
Treated as a child of the family	212
Claim by dependant	212
Practice and procedure	212
Pre-claim investigations	212
Pre-action conduct	213
Collating evidence	214
Proceedings	216
Time-limit	216
Jurisdiction	216

Commencement and proceedings	217
Parties and joinder	218
Role of personal representatives	218
Service of claim form	218
Compromise	219
Who can compromise?	219
How to compromise	219
Taxation issues	220
Costs	220
Personal representatives' costs	222
Chapter 17	
Disappointed Beneficiary Claims: Fatal Accident Claims	223
Law Reform (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 1934	223
Heads of claim	223
Recoverable benefits	223
Contributory negligence	223
Fatal Accidents Act 1976	224
Claimants	224
Heads of claim	224
Bereavement	224
Loss of dependency	225
Disregard of benefits	225
Contributory negligence	226
Interaction with Inheritance (Provision for Family and Dependents) Act 1975 claims	226
Chapter 18	
Creditor Claims and Insolvent Estates	227
Payment of debts	227
Order of payment of debts	227
Insolvent or potentially insolvent estates	228
Methods of administration	228
Order for payment of debts on insolvency	228
Formal or informal administration	229
Protection for personal representatives	230
Trustee Act 1925, s 27	231
Administration of Estates Act 1971, s 10(2)	231
<i>Plene administravit</i>	231
Trustee Act, s 61	231
Practice and procedure	232
Chapter 19	
Tax Evasion, Foreign Taxes and Criminal Matters	235
Disclosure to domestic authorities of information relating to tax and benefits	235
Enforcement of foreign revenue claims	238
Disclosure and other assistance to foreign revenue authorities	239

Domestic crime and money laundering legislation	240
International crime and money laundering	242
Part VI	
Claims against Professional Advisers	
Chapter 20	
Claims against Professional Advisers	247
What claims may be made?	247
Claims against those drafting and advising in relation to wills, trusts and estate planning	247
A claim in negligence	247
Will drafting	248
Estate planning	249
Limitation period	250
Contractual claims	251
Claims against professionals for negligent advice to personal representatives/trustees	251
Claims in relation to costs	252
Solicitors Act taxation	252
Costs of taxation	252
Action for an account	252
Practice and procedure	252
Claims in against those drafting and advising in relation to wills, trusts, estate planning and estate administration	252
What claim to bring	252
Pre-action conduct	253
Commencing the claim	253
Mitigation	253
Rectification of wills	253
Equitable rectification	254
Mistake and Hastings Bass	254
Claims against professionals in their capacity as personal representatives or trustees	255
Claims in relation to costs	255
Pre-action	255
Commencing the claim	255
Time-limits	255
Case management and final hearing	256
Settlement	256
Appendix 1	
Probate Disputes	257
Special contributions	260
Length of marriage	261
Non-matrimonial assets: property acquired prior to the marriage and inherited assets	262
Post-separation accrual	265
Treatment of marital agreements	269

Periodical payments, quantum and term	271
Appendix 2	
Sample Documents and Materials	273
Sample 1: Subpoena requiring production of a testamentary document	273
Sample 2: Affidavit in support of an application under Senior Courts Act 1981, s 123 for the issue of a subpoena requiring the production of a testamentary document	274
Sample 3: Affidavit in support of application for appointment of administrator	275
Sample 4: Caveat	276
Sample 5: Warning to caveat	277
Sample 6: Affidavit of service of warning	278
Sample 7: Appearance	279
Sample 8: Application for standing search	280
Sample 9: Affidavit in support of application for grant ad colligenda bona	281
Sample 10: Claim form requesting court to decree probate of a will in solemn form in the context of a validity dispute	283
Sample 11: Claim form requesting court to pronounce against the purported last will of the deceased in favour of an earlier will on grounds of lack of validity	284
Sample 12: Witness statement of testamentary scripts	285
Sample 13: Letter requesting <i>Larke v Nugus</i> Statement	286
Sample 14: Letter requesting medical records	288
Sample 15: Letter to GP requesting views on capacity	289
Sample 16: Application for an account by executor under CPR Part 64	291
Sample 17: Application under the Administration of Justice Act 1985, s 50 by executor for removal of co-executor	292
Sample 18: Witness statement in support of application under Administration of Justice Act 1985, s 50 by executor for removal of co-executor	293
Sample 19: <i>Beddoe</i> application	294
Sample 20: Application by surviving spouse under the Inheritance (Provision for Family and Dependents) Act 1975	295
Sample 21: Witness statement in support of surviving spouse claim under Inheritance (Provision for Family and Dependents) Act 1975	296
Sample 22: Witness statement of personal representative in reply to application under Inheritance (Provision for Family and Dependents) Act 1975	298
Sample 23: Checklist when taking instructions regarding claims under the Inheritance (Provision for Family and Dependents) Act 1975	299
Sample 24: List of documents to be collated for 1975 Act claim/defence	300
Sample 25: Heads of agreement on settlement of claim	301

Sample 26: Tomlin order (to which attach heads of agreement)	302
Index	303

TABLE OF CASES

References are to paragraph numbers.

A-B v Dobbs [2010] EWHC 497 (Fam), [2010] WTLR 931	6.14
Adams v Lewis [2001] WTLR 493	16.98
Al-Bassam v Al-Bassam [2004] EWCA Civ 857, [2004] WTLR 757, (2004) 148 SJLB 826, (2004) <i>The Times</i> , 22 July	9.30
Allen v Emery [2005-6] 8 ITEL 358	12.108
Alsop Wilkinson v Neary [1996] 1 WLR 1220, [1995] 1 All ER 431, (1994) <i>The Times</i> , November 4, ChD	13.206, 13.214
Antoni v Antoni [2007] UKPC 10, [2007] WTLR 1335	1.62-1.64
Armitage v Nurse [1998] Ch 241, [1997] 3 WLR 1046, [1997] 2 All ER 705, CA	13.41, 13.90, 13.108
Arnold, Re [1942] Ch 272	13.72
Aspden v Levy [2012] EWHC 1387 (Ch), [2012] 2 FLR 807, [2012] 2 FCR 435, [2012] Fam Law 1085, [2012] 2 P & CR DG15	14.9
B (deceased), Re [2000] Ch 662, [2000] 2 WLR 929, [2000] 1 All ER 665, [2000] 1 FLR 363, [2000] 1 FCR 385, [2000] WTLR 403, [2000] Fam Law 316, (2000) 150 NLJ 20, (2000) <i>The Times</i> , 1 February, (2000) <i>The Independent</i> , 14 February	16.53
B v IB [2013] EWHC 3755 (Fam)	16.91
B, Re [2013] WTLR 763, 15 ITEL 784	19.17
Bacon v Howard Kennedy [1999] PNL 1, [2000] WTLR 169	20.11
Bank of Nova Scotia v Tremblay [1998/9] 1 ITEL 673	9.39
Banks v Goodfellow (1870-71) LR 11 Eq 472	12.27, 12.36, 12.37, 12.44, 12.49, 12.112, 12.116, 12.117
Banks v National Westminster Bank plc [2005] EWHC 3479 (Ch), [2006] WTLR 1693	2.28
Barrass v Harding [2002] WTLR 1071	16.116
Barrett v Bem and Others [2012] EWCA Civ 52, [2012] Ch 573, [2012] 3 WLR 330, [2012] 2 All ER 920, [2012] WTLR 567, (2012) 156(5) SJLB 31, (2012) <i>The Times</i> , 5 March	12.5
Barry v Butlin (1838) 2 Moo PCC 480	12.52, 12.54, 12.80
Bartlett v Barclays Bank Trust Co Ltd [1980] 2 WLR 430, [1980] 1 All ER 139, (1980) 124 SJ 85	13.16, 13.45
Bartlett v Barclays Bank Trust Co Ltd (No 2) [1980] Ch 515, [1980] 2 WLR 430, [1980] 2 All ER 92, (1980) 124 SJ 221	13.16, 13.45
Barton, Re [1977] CLY 3182	12.89
Baynes v Hedger & Others [2008] EWHC 1587 (Ch), [2008] 2 FLR 1805, [2008] 3 FCR 151, [2008] WTLR 1719, (2008-09) 11 ITEL 71, [2008] Fam Law 1087	16.40
Beaney, Re [1978] 1 WLR 770, [1978] 2 All ER 595, (1977) 121 SJ 832	1.7-1.9, 1.12
Beddoe, Re, Downes v Cottam [1893] 1 Ch 547, 62 LJ Ch 233, 41 WR 177, CA	13.171, 13.208, 13.218, 13.220
Bell v Georgiou [2002] EWHC 1080 (Ch), [2002] All ER (D) 433 (May), [2002] WTLR 1105	10.18, 10.22
Benjamin, Re [1902] 1 Ch 723	13.40, 13.72, 13.171, 13.223
Berger v Berger & Others [2013] EWCA Civ 1305, [2014] WTLR 35	16.21