
CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	v
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xi
<i>Table of Legislation and Constitutional Provisions</i>	xix
<i>Table of Conventions, Treaties etc</i>	xxv

Introduction

1	Introduction	3
1.1	Introduction	3
1.2	Shared Principles	12
1.3	Two Judicial Responses to Indefinite Detention of Non-Citizens	15
1.4	‘Nationality-Differentiated Risk-Acceptability?’	20
1.5	Criticisms of ‘Nationality-Differentiated Risk-Acceptability’	25
1.6	A Shared Commonwealth Legal Tradition?	28
1.6.1	Choice of Jurisdictions	28
1.6.2	Structural Differences	30
1.7	Plan of the Book	33
	Australia	
2	Limits on Immigration Detention	37
2.1	Introduction to the Australian Chapters	37
2.2	The Australian Legal Context	39
2.2.1	The Constitution and Federal Legislative Power	39
2.2.2	Common Law on Statutory Authority for Administrative Detention	44
2.3	<i>Lim</i>	46
2.3.1	<i>Lim</i> Introduced	46
2.3.2	The Separation of Judicial Power and Non-Citizens	48
2.3.3	Non-Citizens’ Vulnerability to Removal and the Separation of Powers	50
2.3.4	Conclusions on <i>Lim</i>	54
2.4	<i>Al Masri</i>	55
2.4.1	<i>Al Masri</i> Introduced	55
2.4.2	<i>Al Masri</i> at First Instance	57
2.4.3	<i>Al Masri</i> in the Full Court of the Federal Court	59
2.4.4	Conclusions on <i>Al Masri</i>	63

3	Indefinite Detention of Aliens	65
3.1	Introduction to <i>Al-Kateb</i>	65
3.2	The Majority on Interpretation of the Detention Provisions	67
3.3	The Majority on the Constitutionality of Indefinite Detention	71
3.4	The Minority – Gleeson CJ	78
3.5	The Minority – Gummow and Kirby JJ	82
3.6	The Relevance of International Law to Interpretation	87
3.7	The Conditions of Detention	91
3.8	Conclusions on <i>Al-Kateb</i>	95
4	<i>Al-Kateb</i> Contested	99
4.1	Introduction	99
4.2	Administrative Measures	100
4.3	The <i>Offshore Processing Case</i>	103
4.4	<i>Plaintiff M47: Al-Kateb</i> Reconsidered (by some)	109
4.4.1	<i>Plaintiff M47</i> Introduced	109
4.4.2	<i>Al-Kateb</i> should be Overruled	111
4.4.3	<i>Al-Kateb</i> should be Upheld	113
4.4.4	The Majority	116
4.5	Conclusion	118
United Kingdom		
5	Prohibitions, Derogations and Deference	123
5.1	Introduction to the United Kingdom Chapters	123
5.2	<i>Hardial Singh</i>	126
5.3	<i>Chahal</i>	128
5.3.1	<i>Chahal</i> on Deportation	130
5.3.2	<i>Chahal</i> on Detention	132
5.4	The Legislative Response to <i>Chahal</i> : SIAC	135
5.5	The Human Rights Act 1998	137
5.6	<i>Rehman</i> and SIAC's Review Function	138
5.7	Derogations in the European Convention on Human Rights	142
6	<i>Belmarsh</i> in the United Kingdom Courts	145
6.1	The Measures at Issue in <i>Belmarsh</i>	145
6.2	Introduction to the <i>Belmarsh</i> Litigation	147
6.3	The Case before SIAC	149
6.3.1	Introduction	149
6.3.2	Proportionality and Discrimination	150
6.3.3	Conclusions on the SIAC Judgment	154
6.4	<i>Belmarsh</i> in the Court of Appeal	156
6.4.1	Lord Woolf CJ – the Erasure of Discrimination	156
6.4.2	Brooke LJ – the Alien as Enemy	161
6.4.3	Conclusions on <i>Belmarsh</i> in the Court of Appeal	162
6.5	The Certification Proceedings	163

6.6	<i>Belmarsh</i> in the House of Lords	164
6.6.1	The Existence of a Public Emergency	164
6.6.2	The Strictly Required Criterion	165
	(a) Rejection of a Case-by-Case Analysis	166
	(b) Deference	167
	(c) The Applicable Standard of Review	171
6.6.3	Discrimination	173
	(a) The Immigration Context	173
	(b) Use of International Law	176
6.6.4	The Declaration of Incompatibility	179
6.7	Conclusion	182
7	The Periphery of Indefinite Detention	185
7.1	Introduction	185
7.2	<i>Belmarsh</i> in the European Court of Human Rights	186
7.2.1	Introduction to <i>A v United Kingdom</i>	186
7.2.2	The ECtHR on Article 5(1)	188
	(a) ‘action is being taken with a view to deportation’	188
	(b) The Fair Balance Argument	190
	(c) The ECtHR’s Findings on the Facts	191
7.2.3	Conclusions on <i>A v United Kingdom</i>	192
7.3	The Legislative Response to <i>Belmarsh</i>	193
7.4	Substance – The Extent of the Obligations Imposed	196
7.4.1	The Effect of Control Orders	196
7.4.2	Court-Imposed Limits on the Obligations	199
7.5	Procedure – The Development of the Control Order Regime	202
7.6	The Change to TPIMs	207
7.7	The Position of Non-Citizens	210
7.8	Development of the <i>Hardial Singh</i> Principles	215
7.8.1	Confirmation and Elaboration of the Principles	215
7.8.2	The Consequences of Breach of a Public Law Duty	219
7.9	Conclusion	220
Canada		
8	The Charter and Security Certificates	225
8.1	Introduction to the Canadian Chapters	225
8.2	Citizenship in the Constitution	226
8.3	Section 15 of the Charter	227
8.4	Section 7 of the Charter	230
	8.4.1 Relationship between Section 7 and Section 1 of the Charter	230
	8.4.2 <i>Singh</i>	232
	8.4.3 <i>Chiarelli</i>	234
8.5	The Security Certificate Regime	237
8.6	<i>Suresh</i>	239

8.7	Federal Court Decisions Preceding <i>Charkaoui</i>	244
8.7.1	Decisions on Deportation to Torture	245
8.7.2	Consequences of the <i>Suresh</i> Exception	246
8.7.3	Review of Detention	248
9	<i>Charkaoui</i> 's Procedural Solution	251
9.1	<i>Charkaoui</i> Introduced	251
9.2	Submissions of the Parties and Interveners	253
9.3	Section 7 Analysis of the Statutory Procedure	255
9.4	Unanswered Questions	259
9.4.1	Substantive Limits on Indefinite Detention?	259
9.4.2	Discriminatory against Non-Citizens?	262
9.5	The Court's Use of Comparative Authority	263
9.5.1	'Reasonably Necessary for Deportation Purposes'	263
9.5.2	'The IRPA . . . Does Not Authorise Indefinite Detention?'	266
9.6	Deportation to Torture and the <i>Suresh</i> Exception	268
9.7	The Missing Proportionality Analysis	270
9.8	Conclusions on <i>Charkaoui</i>	271
9.8.1	Principled Minimalism?	271
9.8.2	Commonalities between <i>Charkaoui</i> and <i>Suresh</i>	272
9.9	Bill C-3	274
9.10	Exits from the Security Certificate Regime	276
9.10.1	<i>Charkaoui II</i>	276
9.10.2	Exit 1 – Mr Charkaoui	279
9.10.3	Exit 2 – Mr Ahari	280
9.11	Conclusion	282
	Conclusion	
10	Conclusion	287
10.1	Introduction	287
10.2	Divergent Responses to a Common Issue	288
10.2.1	The Decisions of Courts of Other States	288
10.2.2	The Influence of International Law	291
	(a) Australia – The Point of Entry for International Law	292
	(b) The United Kingdom – The Meaning of Treaty Texts	293
	(c) Canada – How Seriously are International Law Obligations Taken?	295
10.3	The Purpose(s) of Detention	296
10.3.1	'Segregation from the Community' or 'Dangerousness'	296
10.3.2	'Detention Pending Removal'	298
10.3.3	The Rights-Protecting Approach	299
10.4	Non-Citizens in Times of Threat	300
10.5	The Importance of Membership	301
10.6	The Integration of Rights and Immigration Control	305
10.7	Conclusion	306
	<i>Bibliography</i>	309
	<i>Index</i>	319