

Directors' Duties

Second Edition

<http://www.pbookshop.com>

Published by
Jordan Publishing Limited
21 St Thomas Street
Bristol BS1 6JS

Whilst the publishers and the author have taken every care in preparing the material included in this work, any statements made as to the legal or other implications of any transaction, any particular method of litigation or any kind of compensation claim are made in good faith purely for general guidance and cannot be regarded as a substitute for professional advice. Consequently, no liability can be accepted for loss or expense incurred as a result of relying in particular circumstances on statements made in this work.

© Jordan Publishing Limited 2014

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any way or by any means, including photocopying or recording, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher.

Crown Copyright material is reproduced with kind permission of the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office.

British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978 1 84661 826 0

Typeset by Letterpart Limited, Caterham on the Hill, Surrey CR3 5XL

Printed in Great Britain by CPI Antony Rowe, Chippenham and Eastbourne

CONTENTS

Preface to the Second Edition	v
Preface to the First Edition	vii
Table of Cases	xix
Table of Statutes	xliii
Table of Statutory Instruments	xlvii
Chapter 1	
Introduction	1
Chapter 2	
Directors: Background and Role	9
I Introduction	9
II Types of director	9
A General	9
B Executive and non-executive	10
III Directors recognised at law	12
A De jure directors	12
B De facto directors	13
C Shadow directors	16
D Distinguishing between de facto and shadow directors	21
IV The director's position as a fiduciary	22
V Groups of companies	25
VI Duration of duties	26
Chapter 3	
Directors in the Corporate Governance Process	27
I Introduction	27
II Defining corporate governance	27
III Separation of ownership and control and directorial discipline	29
IV To whom are duties owed?	33
A Shareholder value principle	33
1 From a theoretical viewpoint	33
2 From a positive perspective: What do the cases say?	41
B Stakeholder theory	46
C Summary	52
D Duties to individual shareholders?	53
E Duties to creditors?	53
V Agency theory	54

VI Process	55
VII Recording actions and decisions	56
Chapter 4	
Codification and an Introduction to the General Duties	59
I Introduction	59
II Codification	59
III Interpretation	65
IV Fiduciary duties	67
V Scope and nature of the duties	70
VI Former and shadow directors	73
VII Other duties	74
VIII Proceedings for breach of duties	76
A Who takes proceedings?	76
B Time limits for actions	78
IX Summary	80
Chapter 5	
Duty to Act within Powers	81
I Introduction	81
II The duty to act in accordance with the company's constitution	81
III The duty to exercise powers for the purposes for which they were conferred	85
A Introduction	85
B Complications	90
C Background	92
D The primary or substantial purpose	96
E The 'but for' test	103
F Focus on the best interests of the company	104
G An assessment	108
H The effect of a breach	114
IV Summary	115
Chapter 6	
Duty to Promote the Success of the Company	117
I Introduction	117
II The section	118
A Generally	118
B Companies not focused on member benefits	119
C Duties to creditors	120
III The development of the duty	120
A The Company Law Review	120
B Company Law Reform: the first Government White Paper	122
C Company Law Reform: the second Government White Paper	122
D The Company Law Reform Bill	124
IV The interpretation of the section	124
A Introduction	124
B Good faith	128

<i>Contents</i>	<i>xiii</i>
C Success	138
D 'Benefit members as a whole'	141
E Factors to which regard is to be had	141
1 Long term	147
2 Employees	153
3 Suppliers and customers	155
4 The community and the environment	155
5 High standards of business conduct	157
6 Members	158
7 Summary	159
F 'Have regard to'	159
V What will constitute a breach?	166
VI Enforcement of the duty	167
VII In practice	171
VIII Assessment	176
IX Conclusion	179
Chapter 7	
Duty to Exercise Independent Judgment	181
I Introduction	181
II The existing common law	183
A The general rule	183
B The exceptions	185
III The special case of nominee directors	187
IV The provision – section 173	195
V Conclusion	196
Chapter 8	
Duty of Care, Skill and Diligence	199
I Introduction	199
II Background	204
III The perceived change in judicial approach	209
IV The new provision	212
V Care	215
A Monitoring	217
B Keeping themselves informed	223
C Delegation	226
D Records and accounts	229
E Reliance	233
F The objective standard	238
G Decisions and hindsight	241
H The business judgment rule	244
I Professional advice	248
VI Skill	250
VII Diligence	253
VIII Non-executives	256
IX Enforcement of a breach	259
X Defences	261

XI Concluding remarks	263
A What will the courts consider?	263
B Assessment	263
C Summary	264
Chapter 9	
Avoiding Conflicts of Interest: the Duty	267
I Introduction	267
II Background	268
III The rationale for the avoidance of conflicts	276
IV The section	276
V Conflict of interest	276
VI Possible conflict	277
VII Exceptions	279
VIII Examples of conflict	285
IX Competing directorships	285
X Former directors	292
XI The effects of a conflict	294
XII Opting out	295
XIII Conclusion	295
Chapter 10	
Avoiding a Conflict of Duty: Application	297
I Introduction	297
II Resignation of directors	297
A Introduction	297
B Exploiting opportunities	300
C Establishing a competing business	303
1 Preliminary/preparatory steps	303
2 Other factors	309
III Exploitation	310
A Introduction	310
B Corporate information	311
C Corporate opportunities	312
1 Introduction	312
2 A strict approach	314
3 A more liberal/flexible approach	317
4 Restraint of trade and hindering entrepreneurialism	323
5 Company not being able to exploit the opportunity	325
6 The company would not have succeeded in obtaining the opportunity	326
7 The company chooses not to pursue an opportunity	327
8 Third party preference	327
9 The role in which the director is acting	328
10 The North American experience	332
11 What is an opportunity?	332
12 Director conduct	338
IV Conclusion	338

Contents

xv

Chapter 11	
Duty not to Accept Benefits	341
I Introduction	341
II The provision	342
III Exceptions	343
IV 'Third party'	343
V Former directors	344
VI 'Benefit'	344
VII Secret profits and bribes	345
VIII Authorisation	349
IX Effects	349
Chapter 12	
Duty to Declare an Interest	353
I Introduction	353
II The provision	354
III Exceptions	357
IV An interest	359
V The disclosure	359
A Generally	359
B The manner of disclosure	359
C To whom is disclosure to be made?	360
D Implied disclosure?	361
E Participation of the disclosing director	361
F Disclosure and single directors	361
VI Effects	362
VII Disclosure under section 432	363
Chapter 13	
Duty to Consider the Interests of Creditors	367
I Introduction	367
II Policy and legislative background	368
III The basis of the duty	371
IV The case law development	373
V The triggering of the duty	378
VI How should directors act?	385
A Generally	385
B When the company is insolvent	389
C When the company is in a pre-insolvency position	395
D Factors to consider	401
VII Is the obligation a duty to creditors?	402
VIII To which creditors is an obligation owed?	405
IX Conclusion	408
Chapter 14	
Derivative Proceedings	411
I Introduction	411
II The common law: some background	414

III The statutory derivative action	417
A Introduction	417
B The elements for gaining permission	419
C The practice and procedure	420
IV The criteria for determining whether permission will be granted	424
A Specified criteria which courts must consider	425
1 Prima facie case	425
2 Elements as to which the court must be satisfied	432
3 Other relevant factors	437
4 Good faith	438
5 Importance to a person acting in accordance with section 172	447
6 Likelihood of authorisation or ratification	449
7 The company has decided not to pursue the claim	450
8 Alternative remedy	451
9 Views of members with no personal interest in the matter	455
B The best interests of the company	457
C Costs	459
V Following permission	460
VI Common law proceedings and retrospective effect	461
VII Companies in liquidation or insolvent	462
VIII Multiple derivative actions	465
IX Appeals from derivative claim hearings	468
X The effect of the new procedure	468
XI Conclusion	470
Chapter 15	
Consequences of Breach	473
I Introduction	473
II The relief	474
A Damages or equitable compensation	475
B Account of profits	480
C Restoration of the company's property	484
D Injunction and declaration	485
E Rescission	485
F Money had and received	486
G Dismissal	486
H Proprietary relief	487
I Choice of relief	488
III Constructive trustee	489
IV Allowance to directors	490
V Third parties	492
A Generally	492
B Knowing assistance	495
C Knowing receipt	499
Chapter 16	
Authorisation and Ratification of Breaches of Duty	503
I Introduction	503

<i>Contents</i>	xvii
II Consent, approval or authorisation by the members	505
III Ratification by the members	506
A The essence of, and background to, ratification	506
B Position at common law	508
1 What may be ratified?	508
2 What about unanimous voting?	514
3 Who is bound by ratification?	516
C The section	518
D Ratification of breaches of statutory duties	520
E Exclusions from voting	521
F A limit on ratification	523
Chapter 17	
Judicial Excusing of Breaches	525
I Introduction	525
II The provision	525
III Background	527
IV Procedure and evidence	528
V Rationale for the provision	529
VI The provision and the duty of care	529
VII The ambit of the provision	533
VIII The conditions	538
A Honesty	538
B Acting reasonably	542
C Fairness	546
IX Apprehended liability	549
X Conclusion	552
Index	553