

	LexisNexis
AUSTRALIA	LexisNexis Butterworths 475-495 Victoria Avenue, Chatswood NSW 2067 On the internet at: www.lexisnexus.com.au
ARGENTINA	LexisNexis Argentina, BUENOS AIRES
AUSTRIA	LexisNexis Verlag ARD Orac GmbH & Co KG, VIENNA
BRAZIL	LexisNexis Latin America, SAO PAULO
CANADA	LexisNexis Canada, Markham, ONTARIO
CHILE	LexisNexis Chile, SANTIAGO
CHINA	LexisNexis China, BEIJING, SHANGHAI
CZECH REPUBLIC	Nakladatelství Orac sro, PRAGUE
FRANCE	LexisNexis SA, PARIS
GERMANY	LexisNexis Germany, FRANKFURT
HONG KONG	LexisNexis Hong Kong, HONG KONG
HUNGARY	HVG-Orac, BUDAPEST
INDIA	LexisNexis, NEW DELHI
ITALY	Doti A Giuffrè Editore SpA, MILAN
JAPAN	LexisNexis Japan KK, TOKYO
KOREA	LexisNexis, SEOUL
MALAYSIA	LexisNexis Malaysia Sdn Bhd, PETALING JAYA, SELANGOR
NEW ZEALAND	LexisNexis, WELLINGTON
POLAND	Wydawnictwo Prawnicze LexisNexis, WARSAW
SINGAPORE	LexisNexis, SINGAPORE
SOUTH AFRICA	LexisNexis Butterworths, DURBAN
SWITZERLAND	Staempfli Verlag AG, BERNE
TAIWAN	LexisNexis, TAIWAN
UNITED KINGDOM	LexisNexis UK, LONDON, EDINBURGH
USA	LexisNexis Group, New York, NEW YORK LexisNexis, Miamisburg, OHIO

National Library of Australia Cataloguing-in-Publication entry

Author:	Pearce, DC (Dennis Charles).
Title:	Delegated Legislation in Australia.
Edition:	4th edition.
ISBN:	9780409328257 (pbk). 9780409331882 (ebk).
Notes:	Includes index.
Subjects:	Delegated legislation — Australia.
Other Authors/Contributors:	Argument, Stephen.
Dewey Number:	348.94023.

© 2012 Reed International Books Australia Pty Limited trading as LexisNexis.

First edition 1977; Second edition, 1999; Third edition 2005.

This book is copyright. Except as permitted under the Copyright Act 1968 (Cth), no part of this publication may be reproduced by any process, electronic or otherwise, without the specific written permission of the copyright owner. Neither may information be stored electronically in any form whatsoever without such permission.

Inquiries should be addressed to the publishers.

Typeset in Garamond MT Std and Trajan.

Printed in China.

Visit LexisNexis Butterworths at www.lexisnexus.com.au

CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	<i>xiii</i>
<i>Table of Cases</i>	<i>xvii</i>
<i>Table of Statutes</i>	<i>xliii</i>
1 OVERVIEW	1
Introduction	1
Making, Publication, Commencement of Delegated Legislation	25
Parliamentary Review	25
2 MAKING, PUBLICATION AND COMMENCEMENT	29
Introduction	29
Making, Publication and Commencement: Commonwealth	29
Making, Publication and Commencement:	
Australian Capital Territory	36
Making, Publication and Commencement: New South Wales	38
Making, Publication and Commencement:	
Northern Territory	42
Making, Publication and Commencement: Queensland	43
Making, Publication and Commencement: South Australia	47
Making, Publication and Commencement: Tasmania	48
Making, Publication and Commencement: Victoria	51
Making, Publication and Commencement: Western Australia	57
3 PARLIAMENTARY REVIEW	59
Introduction	59
Parliamentary Review: Commonwealth	61
Senate Standing Committee on Regulations	
and Ordinances	63
Parliamentary Review: Australian Capital Territory	68
Standing Committee on Justice and Community Safety	
(Performing the Duties of a Scrutiny of Bills and Subordinate	
Legislation Committee)	69
Parliamentary Review: New South Wales	71
Legislation Review Committee	72
Parliamentary Review: Northern Territory	75
Subordinate Legislation and Publications Committee	75
Parliamentary Review: Queensland	77
Scrutiny of Legislation Committee	77

	Parliamentary Review: South Australia	78
	Legislative Review Committee	78
	Parliamentary Review: Tasmania	80
	Subordinate Legislation Committee	81
	Parliamentary Review: Victoria	83
	Scrutiny of Acts and Regulations Committee	85
	Parliamentary Review: Western Australia	88
	Joint Standing Committee on Delegated Legislation	90
4	SCRUTINY PRINCIPLES: INTRODUCTION: 'IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE STATUTE'	93
	Introduction	93
	Requirement that Delegated Legislation be 'In Accordance with the Statute'	93
5	SCRUTINY PRINCIPLES: 'TRESPASS UNDULY ON PERSONAL RIGHTS AND LIBERTIES'	98
	Introduction	98
	Does Delegated Legislation 'Trespass Unduly on Personal Rights and Liberties'?	98
	'Trespass Unduly on Personal Rights and Liberties': Issues Raised	102
6	SCRUTINY PRINCIPLES: 'DOES NOT UNDULY MAKE THE RIGHTS AND LIBERTIES OF CITIZENS DEPENDENT UPON ADMINISTRATIVE DECISIONS WHICH ARE NOT SUBJECT TO REVIEW ON THEIR MERITS'?	112
	Introduction	112
	Requirement that Delegated Legislation 'Does Not Unduly Make the Rights and Liberties of Citizens Dependent Upon Administrative Decisions Which are Not Subject to Review on Their Merits by a Judicial or Other Independent Tribunal'	113
	Summary	116
7	SCRUTINY PRINCIPLES: 'DOES NOT CONTAIN MATTER MORE APPROPRIATE FOR PARLIAMENTARY ENACTMENT'	117
	Introduction	117
	Requirement that Delegated Legislation 'Does Not Contain Matter More Appropriate for Parliamentary Enactment'	117
	Summary	126
8	OTHER SCRUTINY PRINCIPLES	127
	Introduction	127
	Scrutiny of By-Laws and Local Laws	127
	Fundamental Legislative Principles	129
	Scrutiny of Explanatory Material	130
	Scrutiny of Regulatory Impact Statements, Etc	132
	Summary	133

9	BILLS SCRUTINY	134
	Introduction	134
	Senate Standing Committee for the Scrutiny of Bills	134
	Scrutiny of Bills Committees: Other Jurisdictions	135
	Summary	144
10	HUMAN RIGHTS SCRUTINY	145
	Introduction	145
	Australian Capital Territory — Human Rights Scrutiny Under the Human Rights Act 2004 (ACT)	146
	Victoria — Human Rights Scrutiny Under the Charter of Human Rights and Responsibilities Act 2006 (Vic)	147
	Commonwealth — Human Rights Scrutiny Under the Human Rights (Parliamentary Scrutiny) Act 2011 (Cth)	150
	Summary	152
11	MAKING, PUBLICATION, COMMENCEMENT AND PARLIAMENTARY REVIEW: CONCLUDING COMMENTS	153
	Introduction	153
	Australia–New Zealand Scrutiny of Legislation Conferences	153
	Meetings of Chairs of Australasian Scrutiny Committees	154
	Scrutiny of National Scheme Legislation	154
	National Scrutiny Principles	160
	Scrutiny of Delegated Legislation on 'Policy' Grounds	161
	Regulatory Impact Statements, Staged Repeal, etc	163
	Accessibility of Information on the Work of the Committees	165
	Disallowance Motions	166
	The Unseen Influence of Legislative Scrutiny Committees	167
	The 2010–11 Queensland Reforms	167
	Summary	169
12	JUDICIAL REVIEW OF DELEGATED LEGISLATION: GENERAL	170
	Introduction	170
	Right of Courts to Pronounce on Validity of Delegated Legislation	170
	Separation of Powers	170
	General Test of Invalidity	171
	Validity is Jurisdictional Issue	172
	Invalidity Operates Retrospectively	172
	Court Not Bound by Parties' Arguments	172
	Grounds on Which Delegated Legislation May be Invalid	172
	Distinction from Review of Administrative Decisions	173
	Simple Ultra Vires	176
	Power to Make Delegated Legislation Purposive	176
	Self-Imposed Constraints on Review of Some Legislation	177
	Change in Authorised Authority	178

	Valid End Cannot be Achieved by Invalid Means	179
	Review of Delegated Legislation Made Under Discretionary Regulation-Making Power	179
	Rules of Court	180
	Failure to Make Regulations 'as Prescribed'	181
	Anticipatory Legislation	183
	No Liability for Negligence in Making Delegated Legislation	184
13	EFFECT OF NON-COMPLIANCE WITH FORMAL REQUIREMENTS	185
	Introduction	185
	Common Law Requirements for Making Delegated Legislation: Natural Justice	185
	Procedure for Making and Revoking Delegated Legislation	187
	Laying of Delegated Legislation Before Parliament	199
	Disallowance of Delegated Legislation	203
	Publication of Delegated Legislation	206
14	EMPOWERING PROVISIONS: GENERAL	214
	Introduction	214
	'Necessary or Convenient' (or 'Expedient')	214
	'Necessary' or 'Convenient'	224
	'Carrying Out or Giving Effect to' Legislation	226
	'Without Limiting the Generality of the Foregoing Provisions'	227
	'Required or Permitted to be Prescribed'	229
	'For the Purposes Mentioned in This Act'	230
	'With Respect to'	230
	'Good Rule and Government'	231
	Convenience, Comfort and Safety	236
15	EMPOWERING PROVISIONS: 'REGULATE'; 'PROHIBIT'	237
	Introduction	237
	'Regulate'	237
	'Govern'; 'Control'; 'Manage'; 'Determine'	247
	'Restrain'	248
	'Prohibit'; 'Suppress'; 'Prevent'	249
	'Regulating and/or Prohibiting'	254
	Prohibition Coupled with a Discretion	255
16	EMPOWERING PROVISIONS: PENALTIES AND FORFEITURES	267
	Introduction	267
	Strict Construction of Power to Impose Penalties	267
	Variation in Penalty According to Mode of Trial	268
	Exercise of Common Law Rights Not a Penalty	268
	Imposition of Civil Liability	269
	Avoidance of Civil Liability by Legislation-Making Authority	270

	Incidental Punitive Effect	270
	Imposition of Strict Liability	271
	Imposition of Obligation Without Specifying Penalty	271
	Imposition of Penalty Not to Exceed Specified Maximum	272
	Injunction to Compel Compliance with Legislation	273
	Interpretation of Provisions Creating Offences	273
17	EMPOWERING PROVISIONS: LICENCES AND FEES	274
	Introduction	274
	Licensing Powers	274
	Imposition of Fees	276
18	INCLUSION OF DISCRETIONS IN DELEGATED LEGISLATION	283
	Introduction	283
	Inclusion of Discretion Does Not Invalidate Delegated Legislation	283
	Application of Principle	284
	Legal Effect of Discretion May Lead to Invalidity	284
	Statutory Power to Incorporate Discretion	285
	Australian Response to Munt's Case	286
19	REPUGNANCY OR INCONSISTENCY	287
	Introduction	287
	Repugnancy to Empowering Act	293
	Repugnancy to Other Acts	302
	Repugnancy to Common Law	308
	Rules of Court	313
20	IMPROPER PURPOSE	315
	Introduction	315
	No Inquiry into Motives of Parliament	315
	Inquiries into Motives of Crown Representative	315
	Inquiry into Motives of Other Legislation-Making Bodies	316
	Relevance of Motive of Legislation Maker	317
	Use of Particular Power for Other Than Specified Purpose	318
	Legislation May Not Constrain Motive	319
	Motives of Legislation Maker Acting Under General Power	319
	Preferred Approach	320
	Legislation Making in Bad Faith	321
	Giving Effect to Policy/Politics	321
	Motives of Elected Bodies	322
	Ascertainment of Motive Directly from Legislation Makers	322
	Ascertainment of Motive from Other Material	323
	Review Where Motives Mixed	324
	Courts Reluctant to Identify Impropriety	325

21	UNREASONABLENESS: PROPORTIONALITY	327
	Introduction	327
	Unreasonableness	327
	Specific Cases Relating to Unreasonableness	334
	Proportionality	339
22	UNCERTAINTY	344
	Introduction	344
	Meaning of Uncertainty	345
	Specific Cases Relating to Uncertainty	347
23	SUBDELEGATION OF DELEGATED LEGISLATIVE POWER	360
	Introduction	360
	Constitutional Background	360
	Subdelegation of Delegated Legislation-Making Power	364
24	INCORPORATION OF MATERIAL BY REFERENCE	377
	Introduction	377
	Cases Indicating Invalidity of Incorporating Legislation	378
	Cases Indicating Validity of Incorporating Legislation	379
	Summary	381
	Incorporation of Material as in Force from Time to Time	382
	Statutory Provisions Relating to Incorporation from Time to Time	383
	Subdelegation Through Incorporation	384
25	EFFECT OF REPEAL — EMPOWERING PROVISION: REGULATIONS	386
	Introduction	386
	Repeal of Empowering Provision	386
	Repeal of Regulations	392
26	PROCEDURE FOR JUDICIAL REVIEW OF DELEGATED LEGISLATION	400
	Introduction	400
	Non-Statutory Means of Challenge	400
	Procedure Where Statutory Right of Challenge	413
27	PROOF OF DELEGATED LEGISLATION	418
	Introduction	418
	Necessity to Prove Delegated Legislation	418
	Methods of Proof of Delegated Legislation	428
	Effect of Proof of Delegated Legislation	429
28	OUSTING OF JUDICIAL REVIEW	441
	Introduction	441
	'Full Force and Effect'; 'Force of Law'	441
	Conclusive Evidence	442
	Read as One With and Construed as Being of Equal Validity	442
	'As if Enacted' in Empowering Act	443
	Later Interpretation of 'as if Enacted' Clause	444

	Application of <i>Foster v Aloni</i> Principles	444
	'As if Enacted' Clause and Uncertainty as Ground of Review	445
	Refusal to Extend Interpretation of 'as if Enacted' Clause to Other Similar Clauses	446
	Legislation Prescribing Matter for Purposes of Act	446
	Legislation to Be Deemed to Have Been Duly or Validly Made	447
	Disallowance by Other Authority	448
	Direct Exclusion of Judicial Review	449
29	SEVERANCE	450
	Introduction	450
	Severance Where No Statutory Requirement	450
	Severance Where Statutory Requirement	452
	Reading Provisions Down to be Within Power	459
	Severance and Rules of Court	459
	National Security Legislation	460
	General Validity Requirements to be Met After Severance	460
30	INTERPRETATION OF DELEGATED LEGISLATION	461
	Introduction	461
	Interpretation Acts and Delegated Legislation	461
	Interpretation having Regard to Nature of Instrument	462
	Specific Interpretation Principles Relating to Delegated Legislation	463
31	RETROSPECTIVE OPERATION OF DELEGATED LEGISLATION	470
	Introduction	470
	Presumption Against Retrospectivity	470
	Presumption Applicable to Delegated Legislation	471
	Presumption Applicable to Changes in Substantive Law	471
	Retrospectivity May Go to Validity	472
	Other Matters Inhibiting Making of Retrospective Delegated Legislation	473
	Statutory Limits on Retrospectivity	473
32	JUDICIAL REVIEW — CONCLUSION	479
	Role of Courts	479
	Enabling Clauses	480
	Extension of Review Powers	480
	Procedure for Review	481
	Conclusion	481
	<i>Index</i>	483