

The Law of State Immunity

Third Edition

HAZEL FOX CMG QC
PHILIPPA WEBB

Preview <http://www.oxfordjournals.com> Copyrighted Material

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

OXFORD

UNIVERSITY PRESS

Great Clarendon Street, Oxford, OX2 6DP,
United Kingdom

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford.
It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship,
and education by publishing worldwide. Oxford is a registered trade mark of
Oxford University Press in the UK and in certain other countries

© Hazel Fox CMG QC and Philippa Webb 2013

The moral rights of the authors have been asserted

First Edition published in 2008

Third Edition published in 2013

Impression: 1

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in
a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the
prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press, or as expressly permitted
by law, by licence or under terms agreed with the appropriate reprographics
rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the
above should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the
address above

You must not circulate this work in any other form
and you must impose this same condition on any acquirer

Crown copyright material is reproduced under Class Licence
Number C01P0000148 with the permission of OPSI
and the Queen's Printer for Scotland

Published in the United States of America by Oxford University Press
198 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016, United States of America

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
Data available

Library of Congress Control Number: 2013943483

ISBN 978-0-19-964706-4

Printed and bound in Great Britain by
CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY

Links to third party websites are provided by Oxford in good faith and
for information only. Oxford disclaims any responsibility for the materials
contained in any third party website referenced in this work.

Summary Contents

<i>Foreword</i>	v
<i>Preface and Acknowledgments</i>	vii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xvii
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xix
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	xxxix
<i>Table of UNCSI Articles</i>	xlvi

Introduction	1
--------------	---

PART I GENERAL CONCEPTS

1. The Institution of Proceedings and the Nature of the Plea of State Immunity	11
2. The Three Models of the Concept of State Immunity	25
3. The Plea of State Immunity distinguished from Act of State and Non-justiciability	49
4. State Immunity and Jurisdiction: Immunity from the Civil and Criminal Jurisdiction of National Courts	73

PART II THE SOURCES OF THE LAW OF STATE IMMUNITY

5. A Review of the Sources: Treaties and Projects for Codification	99
6. The Restrictive Doctrine of State Immunity: Its recognition in State Practice	131
7. English Law: The UK State Immunity Act 1978	165
8. US Law: The Foreign Sovereign Immunities Act 1976	238
9. The 2004 UN Convention on Jurisdictional Immunities of States and their Property: General Aspects	284

PART III THE CURRENT INTERNATIONAL LAW OF STATE IMMUNITY

10. The Definition of the Foreign State	335
11. The Consent of the Foreign State: Waiver and the Arbitration Exception	373
12. The Concept of Commerciality	395
13. Immunity from Adjudication: the Proceedings in which Immunity cannot be invoked, the Commercial and Other Exceptions	413

14. Immunity from Adjudication: The Employment Exception in respect of (1) A Foreign State and (2) An International Organization	435
15. Immunity from Adjudication: The Territorial Tort Exception	463
16. State Immunity from Enforcement: General Aspects	479
17. The Three Exceptions to Immunity from Enforcement and the Five Categories of State Property listed as Immune	509

PART IV OTHER IMMUNITIES

18. Immunity of Individuals acting on behalf of the State	537
19. International Organizations and Special Regimes	570

PART V CONCLUSIONS

20. Taking Stock	611
------------------	-----

<i>Appendix: The United Nations Convention on Jurisdictional Immunities of States and Their Property</i>	615
<i>Select Bibliography</i>	625
<i>Index</i>	629

Contents

<i>Foreword by Judge Sir Kenneth Keith</i>	v
<i>Preface and Acknowledgments</i>	vii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xvii
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xix
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	xxxix
<i>Table of UNCSI Articles</i>	xlvi

Introduction	1
The plea as one of mixed international and municipal law	1
The functions which State immunity serves	1
The sources of the law of State immunity	2
The recent development of the law of State immunity	3
The three models on which immunity is based	3
Structure of the book	5
State immunity as a case study of the structure of international law	7

PART I GENERAL CONCEPTS

1. The Institution of Proceedings and the Nature of the Plea of State Immunity	11
The institution of proceedings	11
Immunity as a rule of international law	13
The role of national law	17
Outline of the plea of State immunity	18
Proceedings in court: criminal and civil	21
2. The Three Models of the Concept of State Immunity	25
The changing role of the independence and equality of the State	25
The First Model, the absolute doctrine: the independence of the State	26
The inability of the national court to enforce its judgments against a foreign State	31
The Second Model: the restrictive doctrine	32
The distinction into public and private law acts used as legal device in other areas of regulation	34
The merits and faults of the distinction into public and private law acts	35
The Third Model: immunity as a procedural exclusionary plea	38
From bilateralism of rights to a vertical hierarchy?	39
Assessment of the Third Model	44
3. The Plea of State Immunity Distinguished from Act of State and Non-justiciability	49
Proceedings in national courts where a foreign State affects the court's exercise of jurisdiction	49
Special features of proceedings where the State is party	51
State Practice relating to pleas of Act of State and Non-justiciability: US law	53
English law	59

Act of a foreign State	60
The plea of non-justiciability	63
Modification where 'a foothold in domestic law'	65
Modification where a procedural right of access	68
Pleas of Act of State, non-justiciability and State immunity compared	70
4. State Immunity and Jurisdiction: Immunity from the Civil and Criminal Jurisdiction of National Courts	73
The competing principle of sovereign territoriality	75
The extraterritorial extension of the State's jurisdiction	76
Universal jurisdiction	81
The relationship of immunity to jurisdiction	82
The distinction into civil and criminal jurisdiction	85
Additional jurisdictional links in civil proceedings against a State	87
The exercise of criminal jurisdiction over a foreign State	89
 PART II THE SOURCES OF THE LAW OF STATE IMMUNITY 	
5. A Review of the Sources: Treaties and Projects for Codification	99
International conventions relating solely to State immunity	99
The resolutions of international bodies	99
Decisions of international tribunals	100
Decisions of national courts	102
Treaty practice as a source	106
The 1926 Brussels Convention and the 1934 Protocol	114
The 1972 European Convention on State Immunity	116
Projects for codification by governmental and non-governmental bodies	123
6. The Restrictive Doctrine of State Immunity: Its Recognition in State Practice	131
Early development	131
The formulation of a general rule of immunity of the State	134
Common law jurisdictions: UK law	135
US law	143
Other common law jurisdictions	146
The development of the restrictive doctrine in civil law countries	150
Russia and other East European Countries	159
African and Asian States	161
7. English Law: The UK State Immunity Act 1978	165
Status	165
General structure of the UK State Immunity Act 1978	172
Definition of the foreign State	174
Waiver	184
The exceptions to immunity: non-immune commercial activities	189
English law: immunity from enforcement	209
Recognition and enforcement of foreign judgments given against foreign States	215
English law: procedure	222
The Civil Procedure Rules	222
Proof of the status of a foreign State or government	223

Commencement of proceedings against a foreign State	227
Service of Process	230
Burden of proof	234
8. US Law: The Foreign Sovereign Immunities Act 1976	238
Immunity from adjudication	238
General structure of the Foreign Sovereign Immunities Act	
1976 Jurisdiction	242
Definition of the Foreign State	249
Waiver	255
Exceptions to immunity from adjudication	259
The Alien Tort Act 1789 and the Torture Victim Protection Act 1991	271
The Anti-terrorism and Effective Death Penalty Act 1996, the Seventh Amendment to the FSIA	278
Immunity from execution of the State and its property	278
Amendment of the FSIA relating to execution against State property	281
9. The 2004 UN Convention on Jurisdictional Immunities of States and their Property: General Aspects	284
Legislative history: the ILC's work and its consideration in the United Nations	285
Status of the Convention	289
Interpretation of the Convention	295
Structure of the Convention	297
The general rule of immunity in the Convention	303
Exclusions	310
A general assessment of the Convention	319
Implementation by States which have ratified the Convention	322

PART III THE CURRENT INTERNATIONAL LAW OF STATE IMMUNITY

10. The Definition of the Foreign State	335
External attributes as an independent and sovereign State	336
Recognition of a State or government	340
Internal attributes of the State	345
Head of State	347
Constituent units and political subdivisions	348
State agencies	352
Representatives of the State: Individuals	364
Central banks	369
11. The Consent of the Foreign State: Waiver and the Arbitration Exception	373
The nature of consent of a foreign State in proceedings in national courts	373
Consent under the UN Convention	378
Consent of the State to the exercise of jurisdiction by the court of the forum State	383
Consent by choice of jurisdiction as constituting waiver	385
Counterclaims: matters covered by waiver	387
Waiver and the arbitration exception	388
UNCISL Article 17 arbitration exception: limitations	391

12. The Concept of Commerciality	395
The Three requirements for an exception to immunity	396
<i>Acta jure imperii</i>	399
<i>Acta jure gestionis</i>	402
Techniques for determination of the commerciality of the act	404
Evaluation of the restrictive doctrine	411
13. Immunity from Adjudication: the Proceedings in which Immunity Cannot be Invoked, the Commercial and Other Exceptions	413
The exception for commercial transactions	413
The exception for ownership, possession and use of property	422
The taking of property in violation of international law	426
The exception for infringement of intellectual property rights	427
Participation in companies or other collective bodies	429
The exception for ships owned or operated by a State	431
14. Immunity from Adjudication: The Employment Exception in respect of (1) A Foreign State and (2) An International Organization	435
(1) A foreign State's immunity and the exception for employment contracts	437
The three Models of employment contracts with a Foreign State	439
The exception for employment contracts in UNCSI Article 11(2)	443
Circumstances where the rule of immunity still prevails UNCSI Article 11(2)	446
(2) An international organization's immunity and the exception to immunity for employment contracts	455
Allocation of responsibility in respect of employees of an international organization	460
Employment contracts of the international organization and of the foreign State compared	462
15. Immunity from Adjudication: The Territorial Tort Exception	463
Part One: UN Convention Article 12	465
Legislative history	465
Jurisdictional connection	466
Applicable law to determine cause of action	469
Types of tortious conduct	470
Exclusions	474
Part Two: impact of the <i>Jurisdictional Immunities</i> Judgment	475
Three controversial types of loss	476
16. State Immunity from Enforcement: General Aspects	479
The reasons underlying no enforcement against State property	480
State Practice: the general rule and modifications	482
Immunity from enforcement in the UN Convention	490
State immunity from measures of constraint in connection with proceedings before a court	494
The distinction into pre- and post-judgment	495
Types of coercive measures	497
Coercive measures against the State representative	500
Subject-matter of coercive measures	502

17. The Three Exceptions to Immunity from Enforcement and the Five Categories of State Property listed as Immune	509
The three exceptions to the General Rule of Immunity from enforcement	509
Consent of the State	510
Allocation of State property by the State	510
Use or intended use for commercial purposes	511
The five categories of State property listed as immune	512
Diplomatic property	515
Military property	520
Central bank property	522
Cultural heritage of the State	525
State property forming part of an exhibition	527
Conclusions with regard to Chapters 16 and 17	530

PART IV OTHER IMMUNITIES

18. Immunity of Individuals Acting on Behalf of the State	537
The head of State	538
Immunities of other high-ranking officials	558
Special missions	561
Immunity <i>ratione materiae</i> of State Officials	564
19. International Organizations and Special Regimes	570
International organizations	570
Diplomats and the diplomatic mission	579
Consular immunity	592
Visiting armed forces	593
Other issues: private military and security companies and policing and law enforcement	604

PART V CONCLUSIONS

20. Taking Stock	611
<i>Appendix: The United Nations Convention on Jurisdictional Immunities of States and Their Property</i>	615
<i>Select Bibliography</i>	625
<i>Index</i>	629